ECHOES

EUROPEAN COLONIAL HERITAGE MODALITIES IN ENTANGLED CITIES

First Sub-report on Artists and Citizens

By: Marine Schütz (Rennes 2 University)
Elvan Zabunyan (Rennes 2 University)

UNIVERSITY OF HULL
UNIVERSITÉ RENNES 2
UNIVERSITY OF WARSAW
ces Centre for Social Studies University of Coimbra
AARHUS UNIVERSITY
UNIVERSITY OF AMSTERDAM
UNIRIO
University of Cape Town
復旦大學 文物与博物馆学系 DEPARTMENT OF CULTURAL HERITAGE AND MUSEOLOGY
MUSEU NACIONAL DE ETNOLOGIA
MUSEU HISTÓRICO NACIONAL, RIO DE JANEIRO
MUZEUM WARSZAWY
AMSTERDAM MUSEUM
上海市历史博物馆 上海革命历史博物馆 SHANGHAI HISTORY MUSEUM SHANGHAI REVOLUTION MUSEUM
MUCEM Musée des civilisations de l'Europe et de la Méditerranée

SUB-REPORTS ON

ARTISTS AND CITIZENS

14/09/2018

Written by Dr. Marine Schütz

Supervised by Pr. Elvan Zabunyan

This work forms part of the ECHOES project which has received funding from the European Union's Horizon 2020 research and innovation programme under grant agreement No. 770248.

Contents

Summary of WP5 project

The spatial and historical developments of the cities of Bristol, Cape Town and Marseille fully illustrate some of the contemporary arguments about the 'new imperial history', positing relationships between metropole and colony. Their agency in transnational processes defines the relevance of their use as nodal points for the researchers of *Artists and Citizens* WP5 involved in the study of decolonial entanglements in the artistic and social productions. The several artistic and social productions occurring in these nodal points offer a priviledged window for analysing the ways in which different parts of the former colonial system are both de-linked and re-linked, and further recognizing new kinds of heritage practices, located at distance from the former power relations.

WP5 researchers set out to analyse the emergence of new forms of colonial heritage occurring in Bristol, Cape Town and Marseille's sites, built upon manifestations involving marginalized subjects, fostering new ties between communities and altering the colonial use of representation of a space, still bearing, itself, colonial remnants, and to which they are organically linked. As the WP5 is composed of two art historians and one archaeologist, sensory debates, visual and audio-visual sources come to determine the ways of addressing these critical interventions in or about urban space. In using visual and audio-visual archives referring to cities or performed in physical spaces marked by colonial history, artists and social activists' aim seems to address the locations of colonial heritage in order to question the former colonial cities functions, by the very reconfigurations of power relations allowed when audience or stakeholders have immigrant backgrounds.

Due to the fact that images have paved the cultural dialogues between European and former colonial cities, images, visual and audio-visual realm play an important role in the reversal of power relations. Thus, WP5 proposes to turn the difficulty to think colonial heritage, visual and spatial realms separately into methodological statements ranging from the care about the body of works to the use of visual studies. More broadly, WP5 argues for the importance of sensory resources in the methodology, *e.g.* drawing a list of such productions. This aspect, which would stand elsewhere as a basic disciplinary concern, comes here to enact a configuration allowing the study of what makes coloniality an apparatus: its link to visual and audio-visual realm.

General methodology

Databases and library catalogues

The construction of the body of works forms a critical axis of the WP5 methodology. It is materialized by a list of works and reproductions and form a database. It results itself from a survey in databases of libraries' catalogues, museums and art galleries, whose advanced search tools have been questioned with the ECHOES project's key words ("colonialism", "postcolonialism", "decolonial", "art", "Bristol", "Cape Town", "Marseille"...).

During the three years, the list will be progressively augmented and it will benefit from all the discussions, readings and interviews to come with artists, citizens and curators. For now, it gathers productions (photography, installations, video, film and sound recordings) environing the art scenes in Bristol, Cape Town and Marseille, which are critically working on colonial legacies in the form of visual, audio and audio-visual production and focus on concrete sites in the city in between architecture/space and the visual arts.

Emphasis on sound as an object of study responds to the reckoning of a field of practice well represented in the critical appropriations of heritage artists are to do in Bristol, Cape Town and Marseille. The purpose is also to think about practices/media, which historically played an important role in the redefinition of heritage, as being considered are as an immaterial form of heritage. When Musée National des Arts et Traditions Populaires began to collect them, for instance, sound elements were part of realities (such as tales) whose collection was aimed at fuller explanations of societies. Investigated by artists in order to produce a reflection about colonial/postcolonial and to perform a dissemination of these experiments able to fit with entangling realities, soundscapes are since twenty years redefined and valued as forms able to study social issues. From this point view, sound studies can help in developing the reflection: as stated by Milena Droumeva, sound, "rather than being a destination, has been a potent and necessary means of accessing and understanding the world[1] ". While soundscapes can allow reading reactions to changes in technology and while social life informs such enquiries, sound also engages issues such as reflexivity, positionality and historicity of knowledge, deeply cutting across WP5 problematics.

Identifying the artists involved in sound practices is possibly needed in order to curate projects for the three site-

[1] https://prezi.com/ascn05ugl0yn/sound-studies-researching-with-sound/

specific artistic interventions that WP5 has to program. Collaborating with sound artists would not only point to contemporary means of engaging with postcolonial/decolonial issues but would enact – thanks to broadcast sound projects using internet, radio-based practices - to coin connections across time and space of the three cities.

While it forms a sensory way of engaging with research issues and also bears an affective status, when set out for an audience, taking sound into account aims at facilitating the encounters of researchers, artists and citizens.

Body of works

The ability the works have questioning transfers and the performed relationships between former colonial cities of North Africa and Marseille, Bristol and the Atlantic world and in Cape Town determines the selection below. With the aim to restore the diversity of the gazes on colonial past and the different ways in which it could be told, the works have in common to have been made by artists stemmed, for a lot of them, from an immigration background, and to require a thematic and aesthetical analysis according to their links to colonial, postcolonial and decolonial perspectives.

-Lawrence Abu Hamdan

-Dennis Adams

-John Akomfrah

-Claire Angelini

-Ziad Antar

-Driss Aroussi

-Maria Thereza Alves

-Yto Barrada

-Taysir Batniji

-Brigitte Bauer

-Mohamed Bourouissa

-Marie Bovo

-Bristol Radical Film Festival

-Bristol Radical History Festival

-Countering Colston-Campaign to decolonize Bristol

-Burning museum

- Eddie Chambers

- Chimurenga

- Thulile Gamedze

-Gandolfo Gabriele David

- La Compagnie

-La Compagnie les Pas perdus

-Martine Derain

-Monique Deregibus

-District Six Museum

-Badr El Hammami

- Cevdet Erek

-Mounir Fatmi

-Karim Ghelloussi

-Mostafa Goudjil

-Lubaina Himid

-iQhiya

-Infecting the city

- Jamaica Street Artists

-Yves Jeanmougin and Djamel Fares

-Katia Kameli

-Djamel Kokene

-Dalila Mahdjoub

-Nomusa Makhubu

-Amenia Menia

-Antoni Muntadas

-Neo Muyanga

-Youssef Nabil

-Yazid Oulab

-Pan African Space Station

-Marc Quer

-Till Roeskens

-RhodesMustFall

-Bettina Samson

-Zineb Sedira

-Wael Shawk

-Stauth and Queyrel

-Edwin Zwakman

Perspectives in existing literature on colonial/decolonial entanglements

Existing literature in art history and cultural studies addressing creative activities involved in colonial heritage in European and non-European cities provides a rich compendium of sources and images which helps constructing lists of works and artists among certain working in Bristol, Cape Town and Marseille. The ways in which creative processes performing colonial past have led to progressive forms of heritage do not give voice to numerous specific studies. Thus, Anne Ring Petersen*'s Migration into art. Transcultural identities in art-making in a globalised world* (2017) has to be mentioned. "Globalized contemporary art paradigm" and "postcoloniality/modernity conflict" prevail when addressing the performance of colonial heritage in art practices.

Globalized contemporary art

Coined in order to describe 1980s "complex webs of links to other global networks and systems constituting the world capitalist economy" [Harris 2011], "globalized contemporary artparadigm" constitutes a recurrent tool in historiography that comes to assess artistic entanglements. Globalization seems to be a framework that resonates with entanglements in the cities, as they are both results of migration processes. For Anne Ring Petersen, globalization and its cultural consequences – the transculturation processes, entailed by the interactions between people – are understood as the movements of people in culture [Ring Petersen, 2017].

Global history narratives, especially the ways in which they are adapted in mainstream exhibitions, have however to be used with caution. Postcolonial author, editor and artist Rasheed Araeen's analysis of globalization, *Art and postcolonial society* [Araeen 2011] is based on the premise that this notion popularized by *blockbuster* exhibitions is the result of a continuity of the West's worldview developed philosophically "during its emergence as a world power". For Araeen, recognizing that the new situation of mobility has transformed the politics of representativeness does not mean that "a new relationship based on human equality between the people of Europe and its new citizens, who were once Europe's colonial subjects and their European-born descendants" [Araeen 2011, p.366] has been established. Quite the contrary, his assertions are based on the recognition of a gap between global art discourses, which revolve around the statement of a dichotomy between western, as civilized and non-western people, as primitive, and the supposedly postcolonial context they supposed to emerge in. Rasheed Araeen's further critique of global contemporary art encompasses the pretention of these imperial narratives to associate their revisions to liberal values, such as multiculturalism and cultural diversity and to hide what they really are, for the author, some policies hardly hiding the western national desire to dominate the world.

Sub-Report on Bristol

Summary

This sub-report addresses how slavery and colonial heritages in Bristol are performed by citizens, throughout Countering Colston - Campaign to decolonize Bristol, Bristol Radical History Group as well as artistic initiatives revolving around Arnolfini Gallery. As Nick Draper remarks, Bristol, like Liverpool, London and Manchester, is one of those cities in Britain for which business of slavery helped financed some of its finest Georgian architecture. But these cities are still at different stages of addressing their history in the slave trade [Dr Nick Draper, of UCL's Legacies of British Slave-Ownership Project][2]. The British Empire was the largest and most rapidly acquired Empire the world has seen. After the defeat of Germany during World War I, the small island kingdom off the northwest coast of Europe found itself governing, either directly or indirectly, about 500 million people - more than one fifth of the planet's population [Gray, 2017]. The Empire was closely intertwined with the rise of commerce and trade. It profoundly shaped the modern world and its legacies have had lasting and major consequences that continue to reverberate in many corners of the globe as well as in Britain.

While Liverpool has now made such legacies an official part of its civic identity, this report scores the first findings about Bristol where "the slavery issue is front and centre – and is still at the confrontational stage[3]." The initiatives are addressed as part of a transformation of this legacy into an opportunity for making slavery a part of the city's civic identity. However, this shift is mostly assumed by citizen-led initiatives, which constitute most of the case studies.

[2] https://www.independent.co.uk/news/uk/home-news/bristol-torn-apart-over-statue-of-edward-colston-but-is-this-a-figure-of-shame-or-a-necessary-9555333.html

[3] https://www.independent.co.uk/news/uk/home-news/bristol-torn-apart-over-statue-of-edward-colston-but-is-this-a-figure-of-shame-or-a-necessary-9555333.html

I/Citizen-led initiatives

1. Countering Colston – Campaign to Decolonise Bristol

Countering Colston is a network of individuals who are committed to ending the public celebration of Edward Colston (1636-1721), a major slave trader.

The group, which defines itself as an "active network of concerned Bristol residents[4]" formed in 2016, calls for actions to achieve and perpetuate the following positive aims:

- Remember the full, true history of transatlantic slavery, colonialism and exploitation
- Commemorate and mourn the people who suffered and died as a result of the slave trade and recognize the coerced economic contribution that they made
- Celebrate the people who courageously resisted slavery and fought for abolition and emancipation
- Acknowledge and repair, as far as possible, the negative effects in the present day of historical slavery

1.1. Some of the results of the Countering Colston Campaign to Decolonise Bristol. The statue of Colston : a removal or a plaque ?

Edward Colston's remembrance in Bristol relies on several monuments. The debate over how Bristol should commemorate Colston has revolved however particularly around the grand bronze of the man who served as deputy governor of the Royal African Company and held monopoly on the trade. This statue on a pedestal of Portland stone, which was unveiled in 1895 in the city centre, shows Colston pensively leaning on a stick. The inscription that reads "Erected by citizens of Bristol as a memorial of one of the most virtuous and wise sons of their city " does "not mention the thousands of slave victims that Colston and his family trampled over to obtain much of their wealth", as

[4] https://counteringcolston.wordpress.com/get-involved/

it was stated in 2014 by the Independent[5]. [Fig. 1]

In 2014, after the *Bristol Post* asked whether the statue should be pulled down, respondents said it should stay (44 per cent wanted it to go), thus expressing the division of the opinion in the city. Arguments for the preservation of the statue ranged from Colston's role in the development of Bristol's architecture, infrastructures and schools, as for some he "built a load of schools, hospitals and almshouses for the poor[6]". Others had yet in mind his role in slavery : "Whatever 'good' deeds he has done, he did it out of the proceeds of slavery. No one would condone a statue of Adolf Hitler as 'the great builder of superior motorways'.[7]" [Fig. 2] Such testimonies, opposed to the removal, did not signify adhesion to Colston's persona. They translated interest in heritage processes and ways of commemorating in the handling of today's issues.

While Bristol's Mayor George Ferguson described the annual Colston celebrations as "perverse", many residents raged " against what they view as sweeping history under the carpet, should the statue disappear[8]". The city council is proposing to put a plaque on the Colston statue, which will recognize and acknowledge the people Colston and others in the city enslaved[9], facing the difficulties removing the statue. Aidan McQuade, the director of Anti-Slavery International called for this plaque acknowledging Colston's role in the slave trade to be added to his statue, even if it was "a start" and should be replicated nationwide. Other examples were mobilized: "The National Portrait Gallery started to do this in 2007 and it would be nice to see this line of action taken by the City of London on monuments such as Nelson's Column rather than the wholesale pulling down of statues[10]."

The reactions of the group show, however, that they are not convinced by such responses around monuments. While it is attesting of "a move[11]", as Ros Martin says, which is one of the driving forces behind the Countering Colston campaign group, it is not sufficient, especially insofar as a plaque does not allow examining narratives. "What we want goes beyond tokenism[12]", she explains. Such words reveal the group's attitude towards the importance of heritage. Countering Colston Campaign is about explaining and thinking about the relationships between history and commemoration. Its aim is that institutions and "organisations in the city examine their history

---

5 https://www.independent.co.uk/news/uk/home-news/bristol-torn-apart-over-statue-of-edward-colston-but-is-this-a-figure-of-shame-or-a-necessary-9555333.html
6 https://www.independent.co.uk/news/uk/home-news/bristol-torn-apart-over-statue-of-edward-colston-but-is-this-a-figure-of-shame-or-a-necessary-9555333.html
7 https://www.independent.co.uk/news/uk/home-news/bristol-torn-apart-over-statue-of-edward-colston-but-is-this-a-figure-of-shame-or-a-necessary-9555333.html
8 https://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-england-bristol-42404825
9 https://www.independent.co.uk/news/uk/home-news/bristol-torn-apart-over-statue-of-edward-colston-but-is-this-a-figure-of-shame-or-a-necessary-9555333.html
10 https://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-england-bristol-42404825
11 https://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-england-bristol-42404825
12https://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-england-bristol-42404825

and acknowledge their individual roles in the slave trade and beyond". On this examination of historical narratives depends, indeed, "a change of attitudes and culture[13]".

1.2. A new name for Colston Hall ?

The decision to rename Colston Hall (Bristol's major music venue) was announced in April 2017 by the Complet Music Update. The latter reported The Bristol Music Trust's decision to change the name of the venue it runs. This decision accompanies a planned relaunch for the building, for 2020, which is funded through a multi-million-pound refurbishment program. [Fig. 3]

This decision has had important press coverage. Press coverage analysis stresses the reasons for the CEO of the Trust, Louise Mitchell, to change the name. For her, Colston name, which is used by a number of other locations and institutions in Bristol is a "toxic brand[14]". Historical and social dimensions explain her decision to rename the venue. First, no historical links exist between Colston and the place. "Colston himself had no involvement in founding or funding the hall – he had been long dead when it opened – but the building was nevertheless named in his honour[14]". Second, the need to respect the descendants of slaves in Bristol, was especially important, since some are working at Colston Hall : "I have members of staff whose families won't come into the building because of the perceived connection with slavery. We can't have that[15]".

1.3. Artists's roles in decolonizing, as read by the medias

The role of artists and poets in the decision to rename the place

While Countering Colston Campaign was conceived as a citizen-led initiative, it seems that the points of views of artists and poets have been critical in the achievement of one of the campaign's aim : the renaming Colston Hall. The refusal of the trip hop band Massive Attack, which the CMU presents as "Bristol legends[16]", to play in Colston Hall was certainly an important financial loss but also represented a delegitimization of the venue. While

[13] http://www.completemusicupdate.com/article/bristols-colston-hall-to-rebrand-to-cut-association-with-slave-trader-namesake/
[14] http://www.completemusicupdate.com/article/bristols-colston-hall-to-rebrand-to-cut-association-with-slave-trader-namesake/
[15] http://www.completemusicupdate.com/article/bristols-colston-hall-to-rebrand-to-cut-association-with-slave-trader-namesake/
[16] http://www.completemusicupdate.com/article/bristols-colston-hall-to-rebrand-to-cut-association-with-slave-trader-namesake/

Daddy G (Grant Marshall), one of the three founding members of the band was born to West Indian parents, his refusal to play at the venue had real significance in the interpretation of the Countering Colston as a project of decolonizing the city based on the points of views of those who feel that their history is not only under-represented but violated. [Fig. 4]

Another important artist in the mediatic coverage is poet Miles Chambers, for which the statue of Edward Colston in Bristol "is a constant reminder of his inhumanity[17]". Commenting on the effects of the statue and the names evoking Colston, Chambers describes the psychological effect and the impact of slavery today. For Miles Chambers, the Colston debate and struggles for memory are a way addressing today's lives of descendents of slaves. It is about giving greater visibility to social struggles and questioning the colonial cultural legacies from a social point of view. "We can look at the descendants of the slaves and economically they are still worse off; psychologically they are still worse off; mentally they still feel collectively as inferior; more African-Caribbean males are disproportionately in prison and in the judicial system; they do worse at schools; economically are paid less and are working less[18]". [Fig.5]

In his arguments, a causal link may be established between social situation and the sorrow of descendants of slaves, reinforced by the presence of figures like Colston, who are turned into heritage : "The pattern continues and even though many people say slavery is over, because of those legacies we still feel enslaved[19]". Arguing how heritage shapes peoples' living, he states that "a name change or statue move is not going to rectify racism[20]."

Miles Chamber's point of view aligns with the views of Campaign to decolonize Bristol, as decolonization is involved in a broader tasks of changing peoples' lives. The group, who promoted the Colston Hall consultation, lobbied the board and worked with the media, argued that the name of the hall should be changed, so that it no longer honours Edward Colston. But also that the refurbished and renamed hall should permanently incorporate a historical display acknowledging Edward Colston's crimes against humanity and more generally the history and legacies of slavery and abolition[21].

With Campaign to Decolonize Bristol, evidences have been made - at various levels - of the effective function of the notion of decolonizing. Journalists stress the reactions of the Countering Colston group, such as Cleo Lake's one, a member of a campaign, who sums up : "Today we turn a corner in Bristol and history is made. It has

[17] https://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-england-bristol-42404825
[18] https://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-england-bristol-42404825
[19] https://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-england-bristol-42404825
[20] https://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-england-bristol-42404825
[21] Stated aims in the website in the Colston Hall section "The story so far". https://counteringcolston.wordpress.com/colston-hall/

been the continuation of decades of movements aiming to decolonize the city and pay some respect to those whose lives were taken and exploited in the name of capitalism[22]".

The word decolonizing is recurrently re-used and re-adapted by journalists, in adequate ways. Not only they do insist on the Campaign's speeches, but they do valorize its understanding as they foster the points of views of subalterns, that is of descendants of slaves and stress the decisions taken in the name of their fates. Agency of decolonizing processes seems attained as new name will be decided in concertation with descendants of slaves while new perspectives on heritage emerge, as the decision of renaming Colston Hall is giving impetus to heritage from below.

Articles consulted

http://www.completemusicupdate.com/article/bristols-colston-hall-to-rebrand-to-cut-association-with-slave-trader-namesake/

https://www.bristolpost.co.uk/news/bristol-news/massive-attack-play-soon-renamed-38610

https://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-england-bristol-42404825

https://www.independent.co.uk/news/uk/home-news/bristol-torn-apart-over-statue-of-edward-colston-but-is-this-a-figure-of-shame-or-a-necessary-9555333.html

2. Bristol Radical History Group

(http://www.communityarchives.org.uk/content/organisation/bristol-radical-history-grc)

Since 2006, Bristol Radical History Group has organized over 250 events, staging walks, talks, gigs, recreations, films, exhibitions, trips through the archives and fireside story telling.

Bristol Radical History Group is associated to Countering Colston, as it is with other associations. It is also part of the International History from below network.

[22] http://www.completemusicupdate.com/article/bristols-colston-hall-to-rebrand-to-cut-association-with-slave-trader-namesake/

2.1. Opening up some of the 'hidden' history or doing a history of Bristol from below

To open up some of the 'hidden' history of Bristol and the surrounding West Country to public scrutiny and challenge commonly-held ideas about historical events constitute some of the group's main aims. "The narrative has to change for the 21st Century", they write on their website. Challenging the narratives about Bristol reads in dual ways. On the hand, it implies that Bristol's history has not being written. This was due, as argued by the group, to the fact that the events which took place in this city, did not quite fit the national narratives. For them, as shown by the publishing works sustaining the group's existence, Bristol's identity is anchored in a dominant history of socialism, of piratery, of globalisation, many themes which do not necessarily fit liberal and insularist agendas. They also claim that the city played, throughout time, key role in events, ideas and literature, that have shaped peoples' freedom such as with parliamentary reform [Fig.6].

Heritage from below has emerged, as Iain Robertson states, owing to a triple set of criteria located in their subversive dimensions and constructivist positions towards identity and history dominant narratives. It comes when one considers ways of addressing the past that stress anti-hegemonic possibilities, or that exist as resources for expressions of identity and that run counter to the dominant [Robertson 2014].

The group's ways of doing history rely on many assumptions that cut accross history and heritage from below. These include :

-Emphasis on participation and every process, action or perspective related to those involved in the city rather than to the views or histories made by establishment.

- Considering anti-hegemonic possibilities of history and their status as resources that run to counter to the dominant ones.

- Challenge to the academics, attachment to local historians, and the general public (including children).

-Producing history under the guise of collective and popular expressions, such as lectures, public debates, films, festivals and petitions.

2.2. Petition to give Bristol a slave trade memorial & Abolition Shed on Welsh Back

The writing of history of Bristol, Bristol Radical History Group argues, is connected to the project of heritage from below. In 2018, the group's member, Randall Brantley, lauched the "Petition to give Bristol a slave trade memorial & Abolition Shed on Welsh Back NOT another bar! ", which revolved around the future of historical buildings: the O & M Sheds. [Fig.7]

Currently lying empty, O & M Sheds are awaiting redevelopment. They are strategically positioned where a 1000 year-history happened, where abolitionist Thomas Clarkson investigated the slave trade, where was the epicentre of the 1831 Reform Riots and where was the start of "radical literature", related to Robinson Crusoe, Gulliver's Travels and Treasure Island.

What was unveiled in this concertation about the place entered in another stated aims of the project pertaining to the hidden story of the city: to recognize that the history of Bristol is inexorably linked to that of the Atlantic and former British colonies, through its seafaring, trading, and exploitative activities.

The concept

Thinking about what should be done of O & M sheds, local residents came up with the idea of a History Hub. This concept was based on a sense of heritage from below, as it selected for remembrance, the past of a place, which was not taken by official representants and formed rituals that could have - in the present - peculiar meaning for the people who were living in the area. [Fig.8]

The idea was to create a much needed Slave Trade Memorial, a museum and visitor centre, in which three rooms would be dedicated to its own related and inter-related topics:

- one large Abolition room

-two smaller rooms for Reform

-and, through Robert Louis Stevenson, the part played by ideas, art and literature

One important claim made by the group was to offer a combination of history and local-related topics and to connect through the topic of abolition to other spaces: "For Abolition we can connect with London, Liverpool, Glasgow, Nantes (France), the West Coast of Africa, Antigua, Barbados, Jamaica, Nevis, St Kitts and the US. This is also particularly timely and could be a great way for Bristol to acknowledge the UN declared International Decade of

People of African Descent[23]".

Emotional and education meanings

Creation of such a centre responds to two tasks. Emotionally: with "Slave Trade Memorial ", "people can remember and reflect, contemplate and heal – on the quayside adjacent to the old Redcliff Ferry slipway in full view of King William's statue in the centre of Queen Square. Additional sight lines from Bristol Bridge, Redcliff Bridge and across the water from the Exploration sculpture – near the Seven Stars where Clarkson was based[24]." Educationally: the question of knowledge is appraised from the point of view of the "current legacies of the Transatlantic slave trade ", which are, according to the group, institutional racism and Afriphobia[25]."

Significances of the place

The location bears special historical significance in remembering politics. For slavery trade and imperialism, and for the counter-practices, which the latter have produced, ranging from spiritual response to disruptive actions of piratery. The sheds are just some yards away of where, every Sunday for years, St Wulfstan has been preached[26]. Not far neither are the quaysides from "which Bristol merchants led the way with exploration of the new world from the Fifteenth Century and dallied with the African slave trade from as early as the Sixteenth Century[27]".

Literature history is also associated to this site. Novelists seized these elements in their books, stressing how Bristol's geography and history could be thematized in pro and anti colonialist ideas. "Early in the Eighteenth Century Bristol pirates and privateers inspired the works of Defoe and Swift[28]". The Bristol Radical History Group also gives the space a big part in the Abolition throughout the British Empire in 1807 and Emancipation in 1838 : "The late Eighteenth Century saw the growth of anti-slavery sentiment through John Wesley and Thomas Clarkson, both of whom had valuable local assistance[29]".

---

[23] https://www.brh.org.uk/site/2018/05/petition-to-give-bristol-a-slave-trade-memorial-abolition-shed-on-welsh-back-not-another-bar/

[24] https://www.brh.org.uk/site/2018/05/petition-to-give-bristol-a-slave-trade-memorial-abolition-shed-on-welsh-back-not-another-bar/

[25] https://www.brh.org.uk/site/2018/05/petition-to-give-bristol-a-slave-trade-memorial-abolition-shed-on-welsh-back-not-another-bar/

[26] Wulfstan struggled to alleviate the suffering of the poor. He was a strong opponent of the slave trade and was mainly responsible for ending the trade from Bristol.

[27] https://www.change.org/p/bristol-city-council-we-want-a-slave-trade-memorial-and-abolition-shed-on-welsh-back-bristol

[28] https://www.change.org/p/bristol-city-council-we-want-a-slave-trade-memorial-and-abolition-shed-on-welsh-back-bristol

[29] https://www.change.org/p/bristol-city-council-we-want-a-slave-trade-memorial-and-abolition-shed-on-welsh-back-bristol

II/Art in Bristol as alternative space to remember and contest slavery and colonialism

1. General context for Bristol's artistic ecology

The city is known for being the place where originated or lived artists such as Richard Long, Daphne Wright and Martin Parr. It is also leading in creative media (Aardman Animations and Watershed) and in live art (in Between Time Bristol International Festival). There are year-round programmes of gallery-based exhibitions and events at Spike Island, Arnolfini Gallery, Royal West of England Academy and Bristol Museums and a rich ecology of projects from smaller organisations focusing on artist-led activities, that include BEEF, Champ and East Bristol Contemporary and community engagement, notably Knowle West Media Centre[30]. Bristol also nurtures artistic talent with an established network of artists' studio located in Spike Island and in the Jamaica Street Artists.

Jamaica Street Artists (JSA) is one of the largest artist-led studios outside of London and has been established for over twenty years. It is a creative community in the heart of Bristol, working across three floors, with over thirty artists. It is a place of production for a range of practices: painting, installation, drawing, paper cutting, doll making, printing, illustration, filmmaking and more[31].[Fig.9]

The city also hosts the British Empire and Commonwealth Museum, which in its even name recognizes colonial heritage, while a museum like Paris Musée du quai Branly would not assume the colonial heritage aspects informing its existence and the forming of its collection, as shown by ethnologist Benoît de L'Estoile [Loyer 2017].

2. Arnolfini Art Gallery and Black art movement

In 1961, Jeremy Rees started Arnolfini with the assistance of his wife Annabel, and the painter John Orsborn. In 1968, with the aid of private funding and Arts Council funding, the gallery relocated to Queen Square, then to E Shed, the current home of the Watershed Media Centre. In 1975, Arnolfini moved to its present home in Bush House, occupying two floors of a 19th-century Grade II* listed tea warehouse situated on the side of the Floating

[30] BRISTOL VISUAL ARTS REVIEW, 27 March 2018, p.3.
[31] http://www.jamaicastreetartists.co.uk/

Harbour in Bristol city centre[32].

Originally dedicated to exhibiting the work of artists from the West of England, under the directorship of Barry Barker (1986–1991), the gallery moved towards a more general spread of contemporary art. [Fig.10]

2.1. Relation to colonies

Arnolfini Gallery has been an important place where were engaged issues of remembrance of slavery, by artists especially related to Black Arts Movement and artists who were born in the UK, whose parents came from the former colonies, and who studied and forged their careers within the British system. Interestingly, recent exhibition *Art and Empire* (2015-2016), held at Tate Britain, dedicated its concluding sections 'Out of Empire' and 'Legacies of Empire' to such trajectories.

2.2. Location of Black Arts Movement in Stuart Hall's conceptualisation of art and the three waves of migration in Britain

In 2004 conference "Modernity and its futures", Stuart Hall set out a periodization of the art made by three waves of artists with immigration (starting at the end of Commonwealth), in taking into account the positions they had facing art historical narrative of modernism.

After the 1950s-1960s' anticolonial movement endorsing modernism narrative, came the wave of 1980s artists, and their refusal to bear the artistic tradition of modernity (for instance, John Akomfrah and Black Art movement belong to this wave). In playing as a line departing western and non-western artists, modernism/modernity bears a eurocentric nature that can be located (Araeen quotes Enrique Dussel[33]) as a result of Europe's relation to the rest of the world, at the time of conquest of the New World and the colonial expansion. The mention to such a genealogic layer explains why, in Araeen's mind, modernism could gain the status of a colonial heritage, awarding the postcolonial artist the task to challenge, he adds, this legacy.

Then, in the 1990s, appeared the third internationalist wave, sustained by the narrative of Blackness. The way modernism has conveyed ideological effects does not signify its irrelevancy in the production of periodization and historical thought, but gives impetus the artists' search for reinventing criteria more suited to approaches indebted to 1970s political struggles for equality, and 1980s waking of awareness to counteract racial discriminations. Modernism has even become an axis around which Stuart Hall has started a reflection - in a postcolonial gesture of appropriation - on how to rewrite the canon by its margins.

---

[32] https://www.e-architect.co.uk/bristol/arnolfini-icon

[33] Enrique Dussel, "Beyond Eurocentrism: the world system and the limits of modernity", trans. Eduardo Mendieta, in Frederic Jameson and Masao Miyoshi (eds.), *The Culture of Globalization,* Durham and London, Duke University Press, 1998.

In mapping a timeline, which is determined by successive steps of acceptance and of refusal of a model founded on the projects of universal philosophy, Stuart Hall insisted on the discontinued ways in which relationships to identity and cultural entanglements have been envisioned in British contemporary art. His development also reveals how new criteria of producing aesthetic sense emerging from a multi-factorial awareness of identity can be in the same time considered as a conflictual response to modernism.

2.3. Re-emergence of colonial heritage in Arnolfini

As recently stressed by Nichola Gray in her account of the exhibition *Art and Empire*, for *Third Text*'s forum, the British establishment's doors did not readily open to admit artists coming from postcolonial societies and cultures, even some of them were engaged in a common exploration of modernism as seen above[34]. Artist, writer and publisher Rasheed Araeen, who came to London from Pakistan in 1964, is important for his contribution as a writer and publisher to the debates concerning the relationships of artists from the former colonies to the institutionalised parochialism they frequently encountered in the former Empire's heart, a movement of removal which led him to a search for visibility, enacted by 'The Other Story' at London's Hayward Gallery (1989). Within the framework dominating British colonial handling, Arnolfini in Bristol seems highly singular.

2.4. Reading the development of Black art movement thanks to Bristol's Arnofini's programmation

Black Art Movement was born in Wolverhampton in the Midlands as "a visual collective platform in 1982" in a context of "antagonism to the varied migrant identities that were reshaping British society" [Gee 2017, p.24]. The context was a result of a vanishing of imperial dominions (with the Falklands War with Argentina) and values that characterized the cultural ethos of the Thatcher government.

The group's first exhibition in 1985, in Liverpool, organised by Eddie Chambers played a significant role in the development of a position in art aimed for Black artists at defining "their identity themselves rather than being subjected to the control of reductionism of an art world accustomed to exotic simplifications". [Gee 2017 p. 25].

2.5. Trophies of Empire, 1992

In the 1980's Britain, the "vexed entanglements of art and imperial legacy[35]" became the subject of Eddie Chambers' *Destruction of the National Front* (1979-1980), a work in which racism and violence were represented. The "vexed entanglements of art and imperial legacy" also feature at the core of exhibition *Trophies of Empire,* in 1992,

[34] http://www.thirdtext.org/artist-empire-tate
[35] http://www.thirdtext.org/artist-empire-tate

which was shown at Bluecoat Gallery (Liverpool) and at Arnolfini in Bristol. It was put together as a response to the quincentennial celebration of Columbus by British artists, most of which were Black British artists[36]. [Fig. 11]

While topics as marginalisation and exclusion were very much present in the way Empire was remembered, the issue of visibility of Black artists and the problem of their representation was itself a critical topic. Images of Empire/imperial heritage were thus assessed. The presence of colonial heritage was something artists considered as contradictory to their emancipation as artists. For instance, the collectors' overwhelming interest in primitivism in African art produced a reductionism to exoticism, which prevented the contemporary artists in Africa as well as Black artists in Britain from being looked at. In 2012, took place the exhibition *We Face Forward: African Today* (shown at Venus in Manchester), whose essay precisely addressed the legacy of colonialism in similar ways : "While Manchester's collections are rich with the history of art and craft from West Africa – the legacy of colonialism – we know almost nothing about the contemporary cultural scene accross the Anglophone and Francophone countries of West Africa" . *We Face Forward : Art from West Africa Today* was born out of a desire to remedy this. [Quoted in Chambers 2014, p.64]. Visibility is thus transformed as one of the sites for decolonial struggle.

Works

The *Trophies of Empire* exhibition gathered more than fifteen artists. Rodney Donald[36] participated with the piece entitled *Doublethink,* which was one of the best received works in the show. The title of the exhibition was refering to a work from Donald Locke's 1972-4 that Keith Piper had already reappropriated in his installation at the Bluecoat exhibition in 1985, in Liverpool (April-May 1985), featuring the works of Sonia Boyce, Tam Joseph, Eddie Chambers. In that, he attempted to assess how the colonial legacies were sustaining present discriminations in Britain. His installation featuring a constantly looping Slide/Tape sequence comprised one hundred and sixty two 35mm transparencies (two Kodak Slide Carousels each containing 81 transparencies) and an ambient audio track. This work featured 'Letraset' transfer lettering applied directly to the surface of the transparencies, a technique influenced by *Expeditions One: Signs of Empire* (1983) by Black Audio Film Collective. In 1992, he pursued such an exploration in collaboration with the Bluecoat in Liverpool, the Arnolfini and the Hull Time Based Arts, locations for which slave trade was the very making of their development. [Fig. 12] The work showed images and cultural artefacts produced in the numerous levels and arenas of the colonial enterprise in Africa as well of today's images of police brutality in English cities (in reference to the riots the country had known[37]). For this exhibition, the slide/tape sequence was displayed as part of a mixed media installation with sculptural elements, unstretched canvas banners and audio from a

[36] Born in 1961 in Birmingham, UK, Donald Rodney first achieved visibility as part of The Blk Art Group in the early 1980s. During that decade, he went on to become a key figure within the broad alliance of artists, which came to be known as The Black Art Movement. He died in 1998.

[37] In Bristol, the St Pauls riot started on 2 April 1980 in the St Pauls district, when police carried out a raid on Caribbean Black and White Café.

constantly repeating record deck playing a scratched album of Elgar 'Pomp and Circumstance'[38]. It revealed the damage, destruction and profound changes that British imperialism wreaked on 'other' cultures and lives. [Gray 2017].

-Juginda Lamba's response entitled *The Cry* (1993) reminded the visitors in Liverpool the dark connotations that colonial history had carried in the its economic development. The sculptural work was comprised as a rectangular cell made of oak timber and metal chains. [Fig.13]

-Rick Walker, Steve Hardstaff and David Crow collectively known as *the South Atlantic Souvenir and Trouble* have designed a cabinet of curiosities, which proposed a modern consumer's rendition of the fruits of the Empire. It read "tastefully packaged, our top quality sugar, tea and sweet cigarettes offer a unique shopping experience for your to savour, commemorating as they do the European invasion of the Americans which began five hundred years ago" [quoted in Gee 2017, p. 27].

The re-reading of the past into the present was a crucial aspect of *The Trophies of Empire* and the Black Art aesthetic interventions. By interrogating widely accepted historical narrative, the project could unveil mythical beliefs and reclaim repressed collective histories. One of the shared aims of the works was to lead to the emergence of African heritage in Britain as empowerment of previously peripheral actors. As Gabriel Gee sums up, the antagonism between a central government focusing on the role of the individual and local collective entitities fighting to have their identities and heritage recognized stands at the cornerstone of the 1980s aesthetic empowerment of previously peripheral actors. [Gee 2017]

2.6. Port City, 2007

In 2007, collective exhibition *Port City: On Exchange and Mobility* (September-November) was held at Arnolfini. This large-scale international exhibition addressing issues of migration, trade and contemporary slavery[39] especially addressed the experience of migration between North Africa and Europe, exploring people's connectivity. Ursula Biemann's video installation *Sahara Chronicle* followed the routes of migrants across the desert focusing on Morocco, Niger and Mauritania, while the geographical site of the Strait of Gibraltar, this narrow divide between two continents, was in the heart of Moroccan artist Yto Barrada's work. [Fig.14]

-Sustaining new narratives of Bristol and Atlantic journeys

The exhibition made Bristol simultaneously a part of Black Atlantic and of Mediterranean/Europe dialogues, making thus the city a nexus overlapping several spaces and stories. It also took its distance from how

[38] This description is that of the artist's website. http://www.keithpiper.info/trophiesofempire.html
[39] https://www.arnolfini.org.uk/whatson/port-city-on-exchange-and-mobility#ba3e1872cfb54d858e92029faf150868

historians tended to see the relations between Britain and her colonies, for instance in Bristol and Kingston, as a one-way transfer.

-The slave trade in the exhibition

Coinciding with Abolition 200[40] in Bristol, an event related to the commemoration of the parliamentary abolition of the slave trade, several works were made in response to Bristol's specific context. These works explored the city's histories of trade as well as the contemporary port. The centrality of the slave trade to the British economy, which led to the development by Paul Gilroy of the concept of the Black Atlantic, was addressed in the exhibition with Mary Evans's contemporary scenes from the triangle of the transatlantic slave trade and Meschac Gaba's global village made of sugar.

-Maria Thereza Alves's Seeds of change : Bristol 2007

A work like that of Brazilian artist and environmental activist Thereza Maria Alves, *Seeds of Change* : *Bristol 2007,* addressed slavery heritage in Bristol with the image of nature, as a metaphor of inter-relatedness of people. Created for the *Port City* exhibition, the work used "ballast flora", a category of plants that was "the product of seeds which were brought to this country in the ballast of ships" to "dynamically comment on Bristol" [Rice 2010, p.81].

The artist's website presents the project as "an ongoing investigation by Alves on ballast flora in the port cities of Europe[41]". It anchors in the fact that, historically, material such as stones, earth, sand, wood, bricks used as ballast to stabilize merchant sailing ships, have - as shown by botanist Cecil Sandwich - conveyed seeds from North America and Africa to Europe, including cities of Bristol and Marseille where they have germinated (and where the artist has worked).

Seeds of Change: Bristol's proposal consisted in a Ballast Garden that would exhibit historical flora, while serving as a public forum for investigations and participation in the history of Bristol between its residents (some originally from the ports that traded with Bristol) and the scientific community who could collaborate in identifying the ballast flora which had arrived in Bristol from around the world and their contributions the development of the English landscape. [Fig.15]

For *Seeds of Change : Bristol 2007*, Alves had researched sites around the Floating Harbour where ballast would have been off-loaded, taking samples from the riverbanks within which seeds can lie dormant for hundreds of years. These ballast seeds have been germinated so as to make a garden reflecting the different routes travelled by Bristol merchants. One identifies through the traces the displacement of lands and people by the transatlantic slave trades

[40] http://www.bristol.ac.uk/abolition200/
[41] http://www.mariatherezaalves.org/works/seeds-of-change/?c=47

through local flora[42].[Fig.16]

-Aims of the project

By altering the sense of identity of place as belonging to a defined bioregion, the *Seeds of Change* project questions the discourses that define the geographical and 'natural' history of place. At what moment do seeds become 'native'? asks the artist. The moving existence of flora comes to be reinterpreted as an energy dismantling the constructions of "the socio-political histories of place that determine the framework of belonging[43]".

The *Floating Ballast Seed Garden* is an attempt to re-establish the histories of complexities of ballast flora and the potential histories that these plants are witnesses to. In doing so, the artist directly confronts the "hierarchical top-down fashion", what is known as a centre and periphery model and reveals the migrancy structures. Thereza Maria Alves proposes a remembrance of colonial Bristol based on the model of mutual interdependance between Britain and its colonies but whose actual appearance reveals how, beyond a one-way journey, cities were influencing each other as much as drawing their impetus from the center.

[42] http://www.mariatherezaalves.org/works/seeds-of-change/?c=47
[43] http://www.mariatherezaalves.org/works/seeds-of-change-marseille?c=16

REFERENCES

Books

Celeste-Marie Bernier and Hannah Durkin (eds.), *Visualising Slavery: Art Across the African Diaspora,* Liverpool, Liverpool University Press, 2016.

Steven Blevins, *Living Cargo: How Black Britain Performs Its Past*, Minneapolis, London, University of Minnesota Press, 2016.

Diana Brydon, Peter Forsgren and Gunlög Fur, *Concurrent Imaginaries, Postcolonial Worlds: Toward Revised Histories,* Leiden, Koninklijke Brill NV, 2017.

Eddie Chambers, *Black Artists in British Art: A History since the 1950s,* London, IB. Tauris, 2014.

Iain Chambers*, Migrancy, Culture, Identity,* London, Comedia, 2008.

James Elkins, Zhivka Valiavicharska, Alice Kim*, Art and Globalization*, University Park, Pennsylvania State University Press, 2010.

Veit Erlmann, *Hearing Cultures: Essays on Sound, Listening, and Modernity*, Oxford, Berg, 2005.

Gabriel Gee, *Art in the North of England, 1979-2008,* London, Routledge, 2017.

Paul Gilroy, *Postcolonial Melancholia*, New York, Columbia University Press, 2005.

Édouard Glissant, *Poétique de la relation*, Paris, Gallimard, 1990.

B. J Graham and Peter Howard, *Ashgate Research companion to Heritage and Identity*, London, Routledge, 2016.

Azzedine Haddour, *The Fanon reader: Frantz Fanon,* London, Pluto, 2006.

Stuart Hall and David Morley, *Stuart Hall: critical dialogues in cultural studies,* London, Routledge, 1996.

Stuart Hall and Sut Jhally, *The Origins of Cultural Studies: A Lecture by Professor Stuart Hall,* 2010, Internet resource.

Stuart Hall and Paul Du Gay, *Questions of cultural identity,* Thousand Oaks, Sage, 2012.

Stuart Hall, *Culture, Media, Language*, London, Routledge, 2015.

Stuart Hall and Maxime Cervulle, *Identités et cultures: politiques des cultural studies,* Paris, Editions Amsterdam, 2017.

Andreas Huyssen, *Present Pasts: Urban Palimpsests and the Politics of Memory*, Stanford, Stanford UP, 2003.

Elizabeth Kowaleski Wallace, *The British Slave Trade and Public Memory,* Columbia University Press, 2006.

Jérémie Kroubo Dagnini and Christian Lerat, *Histoire emblématique des musiques populaires jamaïcaines au XXe siècle,* folklore, politique, spiritualité, [S.l.], [s.n.], 2010.

Emmanuelle Loyer, *Une Brève histoire culturelle de l'Europe,* Paris, Flammarion, 2017.

Brian Meeks and Stuart Hall, *Culture, Politics, Race and Diaspora: The Thought of Stuart Hall,* Kingston, Ian Randle Publishers, 2007.

Sophie Orlando, Black British Art, *L'Histoire de l'art occidental en débat,* Paris, Dis voir, 2016.

Steve Poole and Nicholas Rogers, *Bristol from Below: Law, Authority and Protest in a Georgian City,* Woodbridge, Boydell and Brewer, 2017.

Alan Rice, *Creating Memorials, Building Identities: The Politics of Memory in the Black Atlantic,* Liverpool, Liverpool University Press, 2010.

Iain Robertson, *Heritage from below*, London, Routledge, 2012.

Olivia U. Rutazibwa, Robbie Shilliam, *Routledge Handbook of Postcolonial Politics*, London, Routledge, 2018.

Gregory Sholette and Lucy R. Lippard, *Delirium and Resistance: Activist Art and the Crisis of Capitalism*, London, Pluto Press, 2017.

Martin Zebracki and Joni M. Palmer, *Public art encounters: art, space and identity*, New York, Oxon, 2018.

Exhibition catalogues

Donald Rodney, The First White Christmas and Other Empire Stories, Birmingham, Saltley Print and Media (S.P.A.M.), 1985.

Trophies of Empire, Liverpool, Bristol, Bluecoat Gallery/Arnolfini, 1994.

Four X 4, Wolverhampton, Bristol, Leicester, Wolverhampton Art Gallery, Arnolfini, City Gallery Leicester, 1991.

Alison Smith (ed.), *Art and Ampire : Facing Britain's Imperial Past*, London, Tate, 2015.

Peer review articles and journals

Madge Dresser, "Remembering Slavery and Abolition in Bristol", *Slavery and Abolition,* 30:2, 2009, 223-246.

Sue Giles, "The Great Circuit: Making the Connection between Bristol's Slaving History and the African-Caribbean Community", *Journal of Museum Ethnography*, no. 13, 2001, 15-21.

Sudhir Hazareesing, "Inteconnected synchronicities: the production of Bombay and Glasgow as modern global ports, c. 1850-1888", *Journal of Global History*, 4, 1, 2009, 7-31.

Tom Slater and Ntsiki Anderson, "The Reputational Ghetto: Territorial Stigmatisation in St Paul's, Bristol", *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers* 37, no. 4, 2012, 530-46.

Seth Whidden, "French Rap Music Going Global: IAM, They Were, We Are", *The French Review* 80, no. 5, 2007, 1008-1023

Andrew Wrenn, "Substantial Sculptures or Sad Little Plaques? Making 'interpretations' Matter to Year 9", *Teaching History*, no. 97, 1999, 21-28.

Elvan Zabunyan, Rémi Labrusse, Maureen Murphy, Zahia Rahmani, Todd Shepard and, "Arts, violences, identités: l'apport des études postcoloniales", *Perspective, Art et pouvoir*, 1, 2012.

Elvan Zabunyan, "Joindre le geste à la parole, All the Power to people", *The Color line.* Les Artistes africains-américains, Paris, Flammarion/Musée du Quai Branly, 2016.

Sub-report on Cape Town

Summary

This report presents findings related to historiography. An analysis of Ruth Simbao's seminal article on *Ambulatory hermeneutics* in Cape Town allows to build the body of works. These examples come to broaden the list of works present in ECHOES project, such as District 6 Museum, that the sub-report explores too, in adding new elements (mainly a brief historiographical overview).

The report also draws on a close reading of Noëleen Murray, Martin Hall and Nick Shepherd's book (*Desire lines*). This fosters invaluable methodological tools and definitions of notions as crucial as heritage, place and memory, which will lay the ground for future analysis, once archival work has begun. The report also addresses intersecting issues of decolonizing heritage and decolonizing art.

1. Context of Cape Town as post-apartheid city

Apartheid policy was mainly expressed by processes of population. Already a feature of pre-apartheid South Africa, segregation was systematized and legally enforced as race became the factor in the distribution of rights [Christopher 1994]. These rules defined after the National Party came to power in South Africa (1948) had effects on making the city with Group Areas Act. The latter's aim is defined as enforcing "racial difference by controlling non-white populations in terms of residence" [Watson 2007, p.459]. As Charmaine McEachern writes, "apartheid was thus a spatial system which worked very much at the local level. In particular, the city, the urban, was central to policy. The city was seen as white built by whites for whites, so that access to the cities by non-whites for whatever purpose, residential or employment, had to be strictly controlled through the Group Areas Act in order to maintain this correct relationship between whiteness and urbanisation " [McEachern 1998, p.503]

1.1. District Six

The District Six area was named in 1867 as the Sixth Municipal District of Cape Town. The area began to grow after the freeing of the slaves in 1833. District Six developed a community of freed slaves as well as of immigrants who found lodging in the area after disembarkation of Cape Town harbour. [Julius 2008, p.106]. District Six was known as an area of a rich political, musical, cultural and architectural history. It was characterized by a large working class community whose members found employment in the city and its immediate surroundings. In February 1966, District Six was proclamed a white Group Area and over a period of thirty years, 66 0000 people were removed to areas on the Cape Flats on the outskirts of the city. The area was destroyed by the Group Areas Act. As a result, residents both witnessed and lived with the physical destruction of their neighborhood.

2. District Six Museum

2.1 Context for the creation of the museum

-Hands off District campaign in the 1980s sought to galvanize resistance to plans by British Petroleum (BP) to redevelop District Six. [Julius 2008, p.106].

-Following the democratic elections of 1994, South Africa has witnessed a sustained focus on heritage matters, both through state agencies like the South African Heritage Resources Agency and prestige projects like Robben Island Museum and Freedom Park, and through more informal, citizen-led initiatives, like the District Six Museum. [Fig. 17]

The District Six Museum opened in the Central Methodist Church in the edge of District Six in December 1994, the year that South Africa became a democracy. [Ciraj Rassool 2006, p.9].The exhibitions cover the groundfloor centre space of the church. Down one side are carrels of 6 photographs grouped around streets and areas of District Six.At the altar end, high up, hang representations of the four main religions of District Six people: Hinduism, Islam, Christianity and Judaism. Below this, a photograph of the skyline of District Six extends across the church, standing for and helping people to envisage the whole District which once stood behind the church.

*The District Six Museum (http://www.districtsix.co.za)**

Established in 1994 by former residents, the District Six Museum works with the memories of District Six, and of apartheid forced removals as resources for solidarity and restitutions.

. The aims of the District Six Museum include the following:

- To provide a point of organisation and mobilization for former residents and their descendants, to maintain an historical claim to the territory of District Six

- To collect and curate memories of life in District Six as an archive that contributes towards the writing of alternate histories

- To instruct visitors in the texture of life in the historical District Six, and in the human rights violations perpetrated by the apartheid state

- To intervene in the current land restitution process on behalf of former residents

- To promote ideas of human dignity, equality, and freedom

2.2. District Six Museum : historiography

Memory's role in the making of new South Africa

As an exercise of remembering, the new South Africa's act of self-construction exists in many accounts, all of which, often competing, have something to say about the present, the 'new South Africa', through their acts of remembering the past. [McEchearn 1998, p.500].

In the 1990s, authors recurrently explored how South Africa's political regime had almost immediately given way to responses in heritage which sought to "confront and seek to give some name to both the obvious and massive political changes". With new regime, "occurred the hopes for cultural and social change which have accompanied them " which came to be reflected in the handling of the past". [McEchearn 1998]

McEchearn's discussion on newness in South African heritage has revealed how constructing an overall identity for this national purpose in spite of being necessary was not going without any risks. Indeed, while it gave impetus to the nation, overall identity's risks were lying in conceiving unity over diversity. As stressed by McEchearn, this perspective lies at the foundation of official heritage Truth and Reconciliation policy in South Africa.

Interestingly, McEchearn unveils the role of memory in putting an end to the apartheid regime: "South Africa's Truth Commission became a decision which suited the fact that here remembering and accounting for the past are also encompassed and circumscribed within the negotiated political settlement which put an end to the apartheid regime". [McEchearn 1998]

In-situ performance of memory as a critique of apartheid

Points of view on District Six museum have focused on the relationships between the city, apartheid and heritage. If the museum is a "powerful engagement with South Africa's past", it is partly because "its remembering is

located in the very heart" of apartheid philosophy. This philosophy and social engineering are the core of apartheid city. Charmaine McEchearn argues that *in-situ* performance of memory becomes a critique of apartheid. The localisation of the museum changes the kind of memory performance which is at stake: museum does not just provide historical account of the harm done, but provides performance of memory "which is at the same time a critique of apartheid itself ". [McEchearn 1988, p.501]

The Museum as a place to make one's autoethnography

For McEchearn, main dimensions of this memorialization rely on how District Six Museum offers practices of autoethnography, in the sense of Pratt, by which people undertake "to describe themselves in ways that engage with representations others have made of them" [McEachern 1998, p.505]. Her 1998 article *Mapping the memory* revolves around this question.

The presence of numerous elements to be appropriated (the map in the central room of the church, where ex-residents can write their adresses etc.) testifies of the importance of participatory logics. Signs as the map are here for the things to "be turned into something else, something living". [McEchearn 1998, p.508]. In this process of writing oneself, the map is about "rendering social the map's physical representation" [McEchearn 1998, p.508]. According to McEachearn, the map "works as a mnemonic". [McEchearn 1998, p.508] [Fig. 18]

A Community-based museum

Like other museum projects in Lwandle, Somerset West, Crossroads and Protea Village in Cape Town, East Bank in East London and South End in Port Elizabeth, The District Six Museum is a community-based museum. This definition rests on institutional criterium of being outside the structure of national museums and "the official circuits of national funding for arts, culture and heritage". [Rassool 2006]. Beyond the forms of governance, community-based museums' functions are assessed by Ciraj Rassool from the case of exhibition *Streets: Retracing District Six* (1994).

Heritage as rematerialising and imagining the social landscape of District Six

For Rassool, two modalities are structuring *Streets: Retracing District Six : rematerialization and imagination of the social life in the district*. While imagining's impact has led Rassool to consider the project as an "archaeology of memory ", District Six's commemoration's performance led to the desire for reconstructing "the material fabric and social landscape of District Six in imaginative terms ". [Rassool 2006, p.13]. Sharing memory provided a sense "for the community to come together". [Rassool 2006, p.13] Rematerialising becomes a cornerstone of community-based

museums.

Restitutions

Rassool describes The District Six Museum as a hybrid space, as it engages politics of representation and restitution (land claim). Creation of HODS (The Hands Off District Six committee) emerged out of civic politics in localities close to central Cape Town in the late 1980s. They mounted a campaign against initiatives by big business and the city to develop District Six along middle-class, 'multiracial' lines, as an expression of efforts to 'reform' apartheid alongside the operation of its repressive apparatus [Rassool 2006 p.9].

Heritage read through a psychoanalytic wave : "A resilient fabric"

District Six Museum shares with movements such as Rhodes Must Fall and other series of popular efforts to decolonize Cape Town the objection to questionable pasts. Decolonizing heritage is read by Rassool as an "effort to displace the dominant racialised, gendered, and class-based perspectives on the past ". [Rassool 2006, p.9] Rassool goes on in his exploration of museum spaces in District Museum Six, which, he argues, were "used as a site of healing and forgiveness". A moral and theological angle to the museum's creation was at stake in the emergence of the District Six Museum.

3. Noëleen Murray, Martin Hall and Nick Shepherd's perspectives on heritage in Cape Town

Uses of public space as contest over identity and heritage

Manifestations of popular projects on memory, identity and restitution have been making and unmaking space. They stand for a way of writing social and political transformations and releasing of energies in South Africa post-1994.

Murray, Hall and Shepherd's argument is that there are strategies that have emerged in the public sphere in post-apartheid South Africa that relate to contests over identity, heritage, memory and community projects. [Murray, Hall and Shepherd 2007, p.2]

This approach relies on a peculiar use of space. "It is in the making and unmaking of urban spaces, they argue, that one can chart the development of new and emergent public cultures in post-apartheid South Africa." [Murray, Hall and Shepherd 2007, p.1]

The revelatory dimensions of space

The authors address the issue of space's ability in Cape Town to connect to identity matters, as it "gives shape to plays of power and priviledge, identity and difference". [Murray, Hall and Shepherd 2007, p.2] Space is also able to reveal history "in many other colonial contexts, the auhors argue, modernist planning coincided with forms of racialised population control". [Murray, Hall and Shepherd 2007, p.2] In post-apartheid Cape Town, space has held peculiar efficiency. It can be seen as the core symbol of apartheid given the centrality of urban planning to apartheid' s particular version of social engineering [Smith 1994 ; Western 1981 quoted in McEchearn 1998, p. 506] Cape Town's space is thus revealed as forming in itself a palimpsest of historical experiences.

4. Decolonizing heritage and art

4.1 Artistic context in Cape Town

As soon as in the Nineteenth Century, Cape Town became the center of a flourishing artistic scene. This process was crowned by the foundation - in 1895 - of the South African National Gallery, the only art museum of the country.

While the theme of remembering emerge as a central issue in the lives of South Africans, it emerges in all kinds of representations generally, starting with visual arts. In myriads of other locations of Cape Town, apartheid is being engaged through memory from the perspective of the present. Numerous exhibitions provide critiques of "the plethora of ways in which apartheid operated as a comprehensive system of rules reaching down into the very minutiae of social life" [McEchearn 1998, p.500].

After years dominated by fervor of Johannesburg as artistic capital, Cape Town has affirmed its place. This renewal goes hand in hand with new activism, of which #RhodesMustFallis emblematic.

4.2.#RhodesMustFall (and #FeesMustFall)

In 2015, the student-led social movement #RhodesMustFall emerged as one of the most powerful and interesting instances of heritage-from-below, not just within Cape Town but globally. Originally mobilizing around the removal of a statue of Cecil Rhodes from the University of Cape Town campus, it went on to embrace a range of issues, including demands for the abolition of university fees and the decolonization of the curriculum. [Fig. 19]

Their actions include removal of bronze sculpture depicting Cecil John Rhodes (a British magnate of industry and politician of Cape Town) at University of Cape Town (UCT). Read by the students as a symbol of a "suffocating whiteness", as stated by sociologist Xolela Mangcu, it was removed[44] in April 2015. The growing tensions to reclaim and remake the past have received dynamic force in the realm of public history: the aims of the group also include the renaming of buildings and streets; a review of colonial legacies in the institution and an outsourcing practices at the University of Cape Town.

While history is a central point of post-apartheid cultural wars, related aims include a review of hiring

[44] http://www.labellerevue.org/en/global-terroir/le-cap/cape-town-affirms-its-place-as-south-africas-art-centre

practices, with a premium placed on hiring black staff and providing scrutiny on the conditions under which curriculum is made in order to decolonize education and knowledge.

Decolonizing artistic knowledge appears a critical point of RhodesMustFall-related events.

Built on removal-based approaches, the actions of the UCT students have included in 2016, blockings and the burning by a small group of students of 24 works exhibited in the university, while one could hear shouting "not time for white tears here". [Fig.20] Members of a trans collective called LGBTIA¨PQ have also vandalised an exhibition of photographs commemorating the first anniversary of Fallist movement (2016). The UCT art school was occupied.

Beyond these removal-based initiatives, intersectional-led approaches are to be signaled within the scope of works dealing with decolonizing art. Collective iQhiYA (comprising eleven Black women with degrees of UCT art school) has made public performances in Cape Town and also participated to Documenta 14 in Kassel and Athens in 2017. Work of member Sethembile Msezane is conserved the collections of Zeitz MoCAA in Cape Town. [Fig.21]

4.3. iQhiya

iQhiya is an isiXhosa word for the cloth women use on their heads to carry water vessels. This is meant to represent 'unshakable power' and an infinite love for the collective. The collective was originally formed by Asemahle Ntonti, Bronwyn Katz, Buhlebezwe Siwani, Bonolo Kavula, Charity Kelapile, Lungiswa Gqunta, Matlhogonolo Kelapile, Sethembile Msezane, Sisipho Ngodwana, Thandiwe Msebenzi, and Thulile Gamedze

The aims of this collective are to challenge the South African art monopoly that favours white male owned galleries through collaborative works asserting their presence in important art venues in South Africa.[45] The collective was formed in June 2015 in Cape Town as a response to young Black female artists' voices being marginalized. It aims at creating a safe space where female artists can share their concepts and ideas, and forms a network that can continuously display works as a collective and support each other's individual careers. "They also seek to contest and transform invisible institutional lines that consciously or unconsciously continue to marginalize black female voices in the art world[46]".

The iQhiya collective has been connected to black feminist theory by recognizing mainstream feminism as a movement that previously tended to exclude the works of black females. Simultaneously, some members of iQhiya spoke of black feminism and of the importance of narrating black female stories[47].

---

[45] *"IQhiya, the Black Female Collective from South Africa". conTRAmare.net.*
[46] "BLACK FEMALE ARTISTS WHO REFUSE TO BE HISTORY'S SIDE CHICKS, AND DEMAND TO BE SEEN AND HEARD: "There is strength in women coming together".
[47] "BLACK FEMALE ARTISTS WHO REFUSE TO BE HISTORY'S SIDE CHICKS, AND DEMAND TO BE SEEN AND HEARD: "There is strength in women coming together".

Marion Zilio, who is the author of one of the first accounts in France, of Thulile Gamedze's work, has put forth a description of her manifold engagement [Fig.22]. The critique of institutions - as they are favoring male artists' works – appears as a dimension recurrently structuring Thulile Gamedze's discourse. Her approach consists in questioning hegemonic discourses and also refusing "narratives, practices and conditions superimposed as a unique truth" [Zilio 2018, p.123]. Post-apartheid heritage emerges more specifcally in her concerns, as she claims to be engaged in a project of "decolonising imaginaries". The artist's specificity is then how she deals with images in order to bring things becoming different.

4.4. The *"hidden curriculum"*

Education is another important theme that the group and Thulile Gamedze explore when assessing decolonizing processes in art and knowledge. Their reflection revolves around the concept of the "hidden curriculum". Thulile Gamedze has written an account for Kassel Documenta 14 where she recalls that the term had been developed by educational theorists in the 1920s. She defines the hidden curriculum as "the reproductive process that perpetually births structures and patterns and infinite versions of things that perpetuate those structures and patterns". [Interview with Zilio 2018, p.123] It is conveyed emotionally on the lives of the South African women that compose the group iQhiya. Gamedze goes on explaining: "I think we agree, as, that when we are together and alone, we all feel it ". [Interview with Zilio 2018, p.123] She mentions how the school and the University of Cape Town are formative of the painful experiences of being ascribed as different, and inferiorised, in physical and social ways. Apartheid was over when she was aged of three - she was born in 1991 -. Yet, her experience has built on feeling oneself different, starting with school. She considers how she was being treated, as she mentioned "being teased about [her] hair at school [Interview with Zilio 2018, p.123].

As the specific relations based on racialised gaze had on her and the other members of the collective effects entailing reduction to appearance and reproduction of power relations located at school, experiencing the hidden curriculum has led the group to gather and "encouraged [them] to learn outside". [Interview with Zilio 2018, p.123] She sums up: "iQhiya is attempting to offer an alternative curriculum to Black women artists in South Africa, one that defies the structural injustices (lessons) of the hidden curriculum that we all came to uncover in our various experiences of the institution".

Several of her works consider decolonizing education in setting learning methods that are experimental and creative. The artist also stresses the importance of the political dimension conveyed in these processes by the shift from individual toward collective. She claims how her "gesture is political because art orientation by capital is an individual mode of thinking [Interview with Zilio 2018, p.123] and invokes a genealogy of collectively structured groups which have struggled against apartheid, as Community Arts Project (in the 1970s and 1980s), MEDU ensemble,

working in Gabarone, or the art centre FUNDA in Soweto, which took part in what she calls a "tradition of creative resistance". [Interview with Zilio 2018, p.123]

4.5 Infecting the city festival

This annual festival, which began in 2008, was initially referred to as the Infecting the City Performing Arts Festival and was curated by Brett Bailey in 2008, 2009, 2010 and 2011. In 2010, the Festival's name was changed to Infecting the City Public Arts Festival. Bailey's curated themes were *Time* (2008), *Home Affairs* (2009), *Human Rite* (2010) and *Treasure* (2011). In 2012, Jay Pather took over as the curator, and in 2014, the Festival expanded beyond Cape Town and included events in Mbombela in Mpumalanga Province.

The performers, in 2009, engaged with the theme of xenophobia. Project Limbo at Church Square in Cape Town (21–27 February 2009) revolved around a figure covered in blue paint and cloaked in an orange hijab. It lingered purposelessly on a traffic island before the start of the "Limbo performance", personifying the 'spirit of migration' [Simbao 2009, p.1]. Different levels of metaphors were included. The site of this outdoor public performance could be seen as a refuge island, and could stand for "an in-between space that provides momentary reprieve for pedestrians crossing a street" [Simbao 2009, p.1]. [Fig.23]

The work is connected to heritage debates thanks to its reshaping of place by *ambulatory hermeneutics*. According to Ruth Simbao : "This opening up of interpretation defines *ambulatory hermeneutics* in which the 'original' of the already known context is recognised in a radical way. What I call 'radical recognition' or 'recognition-on-the-run' recalls, probes and re-creates; it recognises other points of view and begins the process of situational, forward-moving and relational understandings". [Ruth Simbao 2009, p.1]

REFERENCES

Books

Cameron Cartiere and Martin Zebracki, *The Everyday practice of public art: art, space, and social inclusion,* London, Routledge, 2016.

A. J. Christopher, *The Atlas of Apartheid*, London, Routledge, 1994.

Corey Dzenko and Theresa Avila, *Contemporary Citizenship, Art, and Visual Culture: Making and Being Made,* London, Routledge, 2018.

Ullrich Kockel and Máiréad Nic Craith (ed.), *Cultural Heritages as Reflexive Traditions,* Basingstoke, Palgrave Macmillan, 2007.

Achille Mbembe, *Sortir de la grande nuit essai sur l'Afrique décolonisée : suivi d'un entretien avec l'auteur,* Paris, La Découverte, 2013.

Achille Mbembe, *Critique de la raison nègre,* Paris, La Découverte, 2015.

Noëleen Murray, Nick Shepherd, Martin Hall, *Desire Lines: Space, Memory and Identity in the Post-Apartheid City,* London, Routledge, 2007.

Martin J. Murray, *Commemorating and Forgetting: Challenges for the New South Africa,* University of Minnesota Press, 2013.

Sarah Nuttall and Achille Mbembe, *Johannesburg: the elusive metropolis*, Durham, Duke University Press, 2008.

Gillian Rose, *Visual Metholodogies*, *An Introduction to Researching with Visual Materials*, Los Angeles, Sage, 2012.

Cecile Sandten and Annika Bauer, *Re-Inventing the Postcolonial (in the) Metropolis*, Leiden, Brill, 2016.

Arndt Schneider, *Alternative Art and Anthropology, Global Encounters*, London, Bloomsbury Academic, 2017.

Karen E. Till, "Resilient Politics and a Place-Based Ethics of Care: Rethinking the City through the District Six Museum in Cape Town, South Africa", in Goldstein Bruce Evan (ed.), *Collaborative Resilience: Moving Through Crisis to Opportunity*, Cambridge MA, The MIT Press, 2012, 283-308.

Cherryl Walker, Anna Bohlin, Ruth Hall and Thembela Kepe (ed), *Land, Memory, Reconstruction, and Justice: Perspectives on Land Claims in South Africa,* Athens, Ohio University Press, 2010.

Sheila E.R. Watson, *Museums and Their Communities,* London, Routledge, 2007.

Peter Weibel*, Global Activism: Art and Conflict in the 21st Century,* Cambridge MA, The MIT Press, 2014.

Leslie Witz, Gary Minkley, Ciraj Rassool, *Unsettled History: Making South African Public Pasts*, University of Michigan Press, African Perspectives, 2017.

Exhibition catalogues

Kerstin Pinther (ed.), *Afropolis: City, Media, Art* [Cairo, Lagos, Nairobi, Kinshasa, Johannesburg, Cologne, Rautenstrauch-Joest-Museum, Cultures of the World, 5 November 2010 - 13 March 2011; Iwalewa House, University of Bayreuth, 21 April 2011 - 4 September 2011; Preview in Nairobi in Cooperation with the Goethe-Institut Nairobi, 22 May - 4 June 2010], Auckland Park, Jacana Media, 2012.

Peer review articles and journals

Michelle Auzanneau, "Identités Africaines: Le Rap Comme Lieu D'expression (African Identities: Rap as a Form of Express) ", *Cahiers D'Études Africaines*, 41, no. 163/164, 2001, 711-34.

Antoine Bailly, "L'Imaginaire spatial: plaidoyer pour la géographie des représentations", *Espaces Temps : Revue Trimestrielle De L'Association Espaces Temps,* 1989, 53-58.

Christiaan Beyers, "The Cultural Politics of "Community" and Citizenship in the District Six Museum, Cape Town", *Anthropologica 50,* no. 2, 2008, 359-73.

Chrischené Julius, "Digging [D]eeper than the Eye Approves': Oral Histories and Their Use in the "Digging Deeper" Exhibition of the District Six Museum", *Kronos*, no. 34, 2008, 106-38.

Pauline Guinard, "Quand l'art public (dé)fait la ville ? ", *EchoGéo*, no. 13, 2010.

Pauline Guinard, "The Non-use, Re-use, Mis-use and Counter-use of Public Art in the Vilakazi Street Precinct, Soweto, South Africa", in Julia Lossau and Quentin Stevens (ed.), *The Uses of public art,* New York, London, Routlegde,

2014.

Charmaine McEachern, "Mapping the Memories: Politics, Place and Identity in the District Six Museum, Cape Town", *Social Identities*, 4:3, 499-521, 1998.

Serena Nanda, "South African Museums and the Creation of a New National Identity", *American Anthropologist,* 106, no. 2, 2004, 379-85.

Ciraj Rassool, "Making the District Six Museum in Cape Town", *Museum International*, 58, 1 2, 2006, 9-18.

Ruth Simbao, "Infecting the City", *Third Text*, 30, 1-2, 2016.

Dylan Trigg, "The place of trauma: memory, hauntings, and the temporality of ruins", *Memory Studies* 2.1, 2009, 87–101.

Layne Valmont, "The District Six Museum: An Ordinary People's Place", *The Public Historian* 30, no. 1, 2008, 53-62.

Tamara West, "Remembering displacement: Photography and the interactive spaces of memory", *Memory Studies,* 7.2, 2014, 176-190.

Minty Zayd, "Post-apartheid Public Art in Cape Town: Symbolic Reparations and Public Space", *Urban Studies* 43, no. 2, 2006, 421-40.

Marion Zilio, "Thulile Gamedze", *La Belle Revue,* no.8, 2018, 122-127.

Sub-report on Marseille

Summary

The following report investigates how narratives about colonial heritage in Marseille are conceived by artists in Marseille and how these dynamics might influence everyday social relations, especially pertaining to how one is to redefine frameworks for citizenship. To do so, it takes as a starting point a body of works of artists in Marseille, from which to explore how colonial heritage is differently entangled with arts and social relations.

The report starts with some historical context. It then considers how Marseille heritage can be described as colonial and how the notion of coloniality may be relevant to this place. The aim is to better appreciate how colonial heritage in Marseille has been understood, performed and 'aestheticised' by artists, and to periodize these different articulations.

1. Some elements about colonial history and heritage in Marseille

1.1. A colonial capital

Key concerns that need clarification are "colonial" and "heritage " in Marseille. How colonial is heritage in this city ? What are the places/sites we are adressing when we are talking about Marseille's colonial heritage ? While French colonial Empire existed for more than four centuries, starting in mid-sixteenth century, it is the settlement in Africa, especially in Algeria, in the 1830s, which changed Marseille's economy and turned it into a colonial capital. An intermediary position between the Empire and the metropole, on the Mediterranean coast, provided a naturalising logic for functioning as a double gateway: from this place were sent French soldiers, administrators and settlers to the colonies, and also brought from the colonies in the form of people and products to the metropole [Simpson Fletcher 1999, p.137]. As it hosted two of the Expositions coloniales, in 1906 and 1922, the colonial capital was shaped by monuments designed for grand displays of imperial prestige and power, claiming imperial significance for Marseille [Fig.24]. In the 1920s, the municipality ordered sculpted groups to Eugène Sénès, Léon Arnel and Louis Botinelly for the making of the grand staircase of the Saint-Charles railway station, depicting of the figures of Asia, gateway to the East, and Africa, gateway to the Orient. As Robert Aldrich put its in his comments on the gendering of "the most famous allegorical statues of the colonies" [Aldrich 2004, p.174], representations of Africa and Asia are shown semi-

reclining, rather than sitting or standing as generally are allegorical figures of France, cities or Republic [Fig.25]. While he identifies the contrast ruling politics of representation, by stating how womanizing colonies lend to dichotomous perception of colonies and Empire, the general structure of the sculpted group, we argue, can help consider expressions of coloniality in monuments [Fig.26].

1.2. From colonialism to coloniality

In his analysis of what he calls coloniality of knowledge, that is extension, thrived by ideal of totalization, through space and through time of the values of European rhetoric of modernity, Walter Mignolo makes clear how epistemic tradition in Occident relied on the abstraction of its own spatial position [Mignolo 2007, p.471]. Equating center with self, and space with alterity, location was thus used as way to materialize the difference of non-European, interpreted as the sign of their subaltern status. As a result, it is the very notion of space that is colonized. Characteristics of coloniality can be told to qualify Marseille's monument whose strong symetry and perspective, by means of ceremonial stairs designed for spectacular sight performances, reveal a configuration of what Eric Hobsbawm named in its analysis of art and power "the public drama ". These qualities, and the position of the viewer's gaze, as it dominates visually the statues epitomizing the world, provide the conditions under which the viewer can symbolically and physically experiment his own location of centrality as a position of dominancy.

1.3. Cultural studies and definition of heritage

Considering colonialism's controversial status, it seems difficult to see colonial monuments as heritage in the sense defined by UNESCO[48], as the source of universal values, or as the things we want to pass on. Understandings of heritage anchored in cultural studies such as extended definition of cultural heritage as "elements of the past ", of what "embodies vision of the past" or, as Jenkins put it, of "what is or may be inherited " [Jenkins 2008, p.6] seem more relevant for the analysis of what we inherit whether we want it or not. In this acceptance, the sense of the past does not relate to tradition, nor is it conservative, but seems rather eager to play as a disruptive notion.

Dominant narratives on the city of Marseille have been used to conciliate with the Enlightenment tradition of using culture, aimed at consolidating "a sense of national identity" [Kockel and Craith 2007, p. 9]. This narrative indebted to Europe's epistemic tradition inscribes Marseille's port especially within a flow of historical narrations on Marseille, which have characterized the content of many exhibitions dealing with colonial time, as 1982 cultural project *L'Orient des Provençaux,* which was a compendium of 17 exhibitions. As shown by use of genitive, - *Provençal's Orient* -, the region's relation to Orient is reclaimed by France as a possession, and symbolically prevents narratives from

[48] http://whc.unesco.org/archive/gloss96.htm

expressing any possibility of reciprocal gaze, thus attesting to the persistance and maybe nostalgia feelings for old power representations of the city, which once made Marseille a capital [Fig.27].

2. Emergence of colonial-related issues in art: the 1990s. La Compagnie

2.1. Demographic, historical and artistic contexts : the importance of Belsunce

Paul-Emmanuel Odin's emphasis on La Compagnie's social dimension

A first wave of research in WP5 has put forth a break within such conceptions of heritage in Marseille. Created in 1991, the artistic association La Compagnie (located at 19 rue Francis de Pressensé, in Belsunce district area) is one of these critical places. Its creation emerged in Marseille as the city saw in the 1990s the development of numerous artistic associations, workshops and associative galleries. Within this realm, its specificity was to experiment social issues including colonial history and its effects on present. Part of La Compagnie's concerns pointed to the lives of local communities it was surrounded by.

La Compagnie's today director, Paul-Emmanuel Odin, recently described the association's project as a locus for social questionings, taking over the last 30 years's definition of art as framing social issues. Although a heir of avant-garde and modernist French traditions, which were dominant in Southern France, as shown by the local public collections in Musée Cantini or in le MAC (Musée d'Art Contemporain), la Compagnie argues for a blurring of "social frontiers inherent to practices and knowledge (all that relates to the political, to the social, to desire, to the symbolical, to the critical field, until documentary and militant approaches)[49]. "

Such presentation of today's project makes clear how rethinking exhibitions' frames and art's function, during the heydey of La Compagnie were aligned into a social agenda. La Compagnie makes social issue of accessing art one of its challenges. It was about finding new ways for posing the question "How to do to let passersby go through our fragile walls, and not only those coming with a particular background, the inhabitants of the district or contemporary art lovers? "[50].

---

[49] [Brouillent les frontières sociales indissociables des pratiques et des savoirs (tout ce qui a trait au politique, au social, au désir, au symbolique, à la critique, jusqu'aux approches documentaires et militantes)]. http://www.marseilleexpos.com/les-membres/liste-des-structures/la-compagnie/

[50]"Comment faire pour que les passants traversent nos murs fragiles, et non pas seulement tel ou tel milieu, les habitants du quartier, ou les amateurs d'art contemporain?" *ibid.*

Belsunce, a transnationally-structured district

Making La Compagnie an apparatus which would break the walls does not restrict to class issues, but concern, more specifically, the possibility of unsettling the discriminating racial and social walls – as the population of the area is mainly of African descent – which structure the norms of art consumption. Walking in the area of Belsunce is, for an artist working with La Compagnie, making the experience of a transnationally-structured world, a dimension of which economy and colonial history are responsible for.

Algerian presence in Belsunce

As anthropologist Michel Peraldi has shown, the district's transnational structure is connected to a peculiar "Economie du bazar". A strong Algerian presence is to be observed in the district. According to Peraldi, this is an "old story ", which finds in colonialism one of its sources, when workers during World War I, have been replaced by Kabyle people.

After this first temporal layer, determined by war, trade played great part in the arrival of Algerian people (when came the so-called Moorish Cafe owners), and then came 1970s "great migration", [la"grande migration" des années 1970 ; Peraldi 2001, p.48]. Employed as workforce, the Algerian population joined factories and construction sites, which were numerous in the area between the port and the train station. Belsunce's demography, where are living the daughters and the sons of the immigrants, bears a living trace of colonialism. Anyone who wanders along the Cours Belsunce in Marseille sees a cosmopolitan population with women in boubous and others in dark veils, walking alongside Maghrebins and black Africans in sweatshirts and jeans. In this space where are enacted the dramas of islamophobia (in the media, especially) and small delinquency born amidst poverty, the artists' studios and galleries are numerous as well as the works site-specifically made.

While geographic situation, in the heart of the district of Belsunce was responsible for curating works for which present historical context was important, La Compagnie curated works involved in post-colonial matters. In the 1990s, as Anne Donadey has put it, the French just began to leave behind the phase of repression and denial of France's Algerian past to enter "a far more garrulous phase associated with the Freudian talking cure " [Quoted in McGonagle 2017]. Even if each exhibition, residency and editorial activity (*L'Inventaire*) did not concern colonial heritage, the temporality and the location were playing *de facto* as conditions under which the exhibitions'contents and works might take part into discussion cutting across WP1's framework and more specially revolving around, and run parallel a shift from repression to re-emergence of colonial heritage.

2.2. Re-emergence of colonial heritage in Marc Quer's project Algérie-France

Description of the project

Marc Quer's[52] works and their emphasis on the lived and often collaborative experiences provide an insight into reemergence as a sensible and ontological issue. His works *Algérie-France: images 1998 Affiches d'après les photographies de Félix Moulin de 1856* [Fig.28] were made in 1998, at the invitation of photographer Estelle Fredet, in residence at La Compagnie. The project was based on the use of photographs made during the time Algeria was a French colony, in 1856, by Félix Moulin. The very physical aspect of his work cannot hide that his subject was the inhabitants' subjectivities and gazes on their own pasts. The artist clearly wanted to facilitate these expressions through a display where one could write on copies of pictures that had coined representations freezing Algerians in predetermined roles or in exotica contradicting egalitarian ideals. He transformed some images in inscribing empty comic balloons and pasted them onto the walls of Belsunce. He then gathered 27 copies, he exhibited in La Compagnie. Participatory methods, leaving the audience interact on the documents in an extension of heritage practice from the artist to the citizens tended to remind how iconography provided insights into the ideology of imperialism during the heyday of Empire. As Quer has explained, he wanted to show images which "were still present in collective memory, and underline the tensions they still bear and to bring them to the gaze of each in order to generate, according to the new and the personal stories, reflection and testimonies which were collected by means and on various supports[51]".

Impredictable reactions were to be observed as the colonial revealed itself able to foster comments about contemporary life. The pictures gave a voice to today's young and Maghrebin people, deprived of words, who used them as resources to negotiate in the present their own feelings of being dominated. Some translated their ordinary experiences while other expressed themselves by the most limited gestures of marking or scratching the paper. Thus these pictures were about the possibility of retroactively render the speech to those who had been deprived of words.

Performance of memory in the context of the street

This example allows to discuss cityspace and how it becomes a point of mobilization and of protest by a complex range of actors including minority groups, social movements and the descendants of enslaved or immigrated persons [Fig.29]. Beyond institutional artistic activities, in Marseille the public space or the street is not only a dual place of conflicts or gatherings and of protests, but comes to "symbolize a location of expression" [Zabunyan 2016], whose role has to be assessed in the production of contemporary aesthetics marked, as shown by Elvan Zabunyan in her study of African American art and culture*, Joindre le geste à la parole, All the power to the People*, by images of gatherings, of

[51] http://www.documentsdartistes.org/artistes/quer/repro38.html

the crowd, and whose sense lies more and more in endorsing social issues.

2.3. Example of the dynamics of reemergence of colonial heritage in Belsunce: documenting colonial removal. Martine Derain and Dalila Mahdjoub

Martine Derain and Dalila Mahdjoub are other artists who have investigated colonial heritage in their practices in documenting the physical destruction of Belsunce –which took place in the 1990s under the name of Euromed planning project[52]. The streets, the memory and the events in Belsunce have become the basis for making the district, for many artists, who wanted to assess how colonialism has been forgotten in French memory after the end of the Empire, but never stops pushing its way to the surface facing social issues and racism. For the artists, working in studios located in Joliette or Belsunce, attests to the impossibility to consider the colonial at distance and to the necessity to find contemporary forms for translating this heritage.

In 2007, Martine Derain realises with artist Dalila Mahdjoub the work entitled *D'Un seuil à l'autre [Perspective sur une chambre avec ses habitants]* [Fig.30]. The project wanted to highlight the forms of continuity that might exist, in spite of political changes, from colonialism to Algerian independance, for the poor Algerian workers. Writer Gilles Ascaride, author with Salvatore Condro of the book *Précarité à tous les étages* and other conferences addressed the issue of work in young postcolonial Marseille, and its consequences today, in focusing on a building located in Belsunce, Sonacotra, which hosted the poorest Algerian workers who are today retirees. Created in 1956 and aimed at provisionally housing Algerian workers, the Sonacotra - *Société Nationale de Construction pour les Travailleurs Algériens* – now Adoma since 2007, still opens its doors to the poorest workers.

The artists addressed this issue in reframing part of this colonial and forgotten heritage. Sonacotra residence had a precedent in Argenteuil (near Paris) with Residence du Parc. The artists appropriated two doors of this building and buried them into boxes, that they then displayed in front of the door of Marseille Sonacotra, a few meters far from La Compagnie [Fig.31].

The need for visibility was accompanied by the attempt to manage memory and heritage politics. This project at la Compagnie included not only an installation but a publication, series of talks and militant actions such as taking contact with public authority in order to know if were preserved any archives related to the construction of social residence Sonacotra in Belsunce. Photographer Grégoire Keussayan, who had photographed workers living in Marseille since the 1950s joined the project, and hundred of footages filming the work of Algerian people emerged. The artists addressed the issue of work to produce the transfer of heritage values, in involving the workers, their images

[52] See the artist's website http://documentsdartistes.org/artistes/derain/repro.html

and the places where they had lived, or were living, in a way which renewed usual perspectives of dealing with colonial heritage (removal, indifference etc.)

Colonial heritage was addressed by the issue of living in metropole, what was embodied by the doors, which constitute the physical and poetical cores of the project. Interestingly, Derain and Mahdjoub seemed to know about the revolutionary potential of this trope in Algerian imaginary, as the title of the installation 'on the threshold of the residence', located at 35 Francis de Pressensé street was a reference to Kabyle proverb telling "where people welcome the visitors, things are going upside down" [Fig.32]. The doors became thus metaphor of the desire for home and place in France, for an economic hope and maybe of new ways addressing hospitality.

The policies of repressing of colonial heritage: a source for artistic involvement in politics of colonial heritage?

Engagement of artists in favor of the Algerian memory in the district may explain why colonial heritage re-emerged. Several works made in la Compagnie responded to the removals entailed by real estate speculation in the 1990s and transformed the anger it provoked into a source of energy unleashing personal and collective stories in displays mobilised against official policies of silencing colonial memory. Issue of housing, social problems and urban planning, built on a social and cultural divide, occur as crossed issues in which la Compagnie deals with colonial history.

Since the 1990s, official urbanistic initiatives aimed at the city's center regeneration attempted to –destroy part of the old town, and to reset Marseille's planning in claiming to modernize city housing and infrastructures. The city, until the 1980s, seemed constructed around a physical space embodied by the Canebière, a limit intersecting economic and cultural divides, between the poor, the Maghrebin and African descents, at the North of the city, and the white, and richest populations in the South. Revealing the presence of past in the present city, this partition owes to the historical development of the harbor activities during colonial era, which entailed an economy appealing more and more Maghrebin and African workers, from the 1920s until the decolonization and the immigration of Algerian, especially, who were employed for reconstructing the city, until the 1980s.

Marseille's status in the 1920s as a nexus of the "imperial network" is responsible for the poverty and disqualification as the city was used as an arrival point for raw materials that would be delivered and transformed in Lyon. This fact is of special importance and makes the economic and symbolic consequences of colonialism more ambiguous than it first seems. On the one hand, in being limited to the function of a transit station of very simple object or materials, the city's development strategies prevented historically Marseille from developing itself as an industrial place, what would have given immigrant workers a wealthier status. On the other hand, Marseille's identity as modern colonial city, as a place dedicated to the transport of untransformed raw goods, entailed a non-qualified labor force, closely connected to the recurrent myth according to which the city's inhabitants would be lazy and bungling. Belsunce district is thus geographically ambivalent: marking a social and racial continuity with the North and

the suburbs of the city, it stands at the heart of the city were are concentrated infrastructures for tourism what makes it a space that promoters desire to possess.

Belsunce district as a multilingual and multicultural space, nurtured by several communities, shaping the life in postcolonial era is a consequence of the settling in this area of the workers who earned their lives on colonial economy. In this context, the 1990s destruction of buildings and expulsion of inhabitants entailed the repression of a physical reality reflecting on the demographical consequences of the cultural metamorphosis.

2.4. Is art in Marseille a part of decolonial aesthetics?

In Mignolo's reflections, the museum bears a special status because it is the place where was historically embodied "the need to convert and civilize the inhabitants of the planet that were still outside history, the barbarians and primitives" [Mignolo 2004]. But the arguments he develops about the museum enter into a "decolonial shift' and can form the basis of decolonial aesthetics. As Mignolo writes in the conclusion of essay *Museum in the Colonial Horizon of Modernity*: "At some point of articulation, some choose music, others scholarly research and arguments; still others articulate change through social movements, like Evo Morales in Bolivia" [Mignolo 2004].

How to define decolonial aesthetics? Decolonial aesthetics, as it is advocated by Mignolo, could be identified by a series of aspects:

-Semantics involved in colonial history, institutions, collecting, etc.

In *Mining the museum,* Fred Wilson's work deals with museum collections of indigenous artefacts which have been "brought" from South America to the Museum of World History.

- Uncovering

Decolonial aesthetics can be located in works engaged in a movement which brings objects to the surface. Mignolo's conception of the visual realities and more specifically of museum associates a deceptive conception of the visible. That is why artist's mission will be somehow involved in the practice of shadowing or uncovering.

- An aesthetic of displacement

Walter Mignolo argues: "decolonial shift is not just a change in the content, but is in the logic and aesthetic disobedience" [Mignolo 2004].

- Effects on the audience, as if the world was turning upside down

T

he projects made in la Compagnie provide a field to discuss the relevance of the notion of decoloniality for art works in Marseille as they stress the role of the audience and the image of reversal, as if the world was turning upside down. About Fred Wilson's work's effects on him and the audience (what is reconstructed thanks to press cover), Mignolo uses a comparison with the invasion of Spanish troops and missionaries of the Andean region of the Inca Empire from the perspective of the inhabitants of Tawantinsuyu: "the world was suddenly turned upside down" [Mignolo 2004]. Decolonial works engage a peculiar type of audience experience, where can be felt the reversal of the modern/colonial world, undermining the principles of knowledge on which modernity has been built since the Renaissance" [Mignolo 2004].

3. The 2000s transition : framing the interconnectivity of Marseille as an artistic subject: a turning point in artists and citizens topics in Marseille ?

In contrast to 1990s projects where colonial heritage was seized so as to reveal how contemporary France was the site of power relations where old power relations between countries could still exist, in the eve of the 2000s, artistic production has known a critical change. Not only, the question of the city came on the foreground, but the duality of France/Algeria and Marseille/Algiers, became a prominent motif when surveying contemporary visual production addressing Marseille's city and colonial heritage.

3.1. Project Mari-Mira

From 1995 to 2007, artist Guy-André Lagesse worked on a "transportable and mutable set " [Interview with the artist, by the author, 2018] of shacks, whose sense was to move from a city to another, from Port Louis, Mauritius, Marseille, Paris, France, Suva, in the Fiji Islands, and Durban in South Africa [Fig.33]. Created each time collectively with local inhabitants, and enriched by the objects that were locally collected to build houses, the installation participates in an aesthetic map, making connections between and across art practices, cultures and exchanges. In 2007, this open-air installation titled *Mari Mira* settled in Marseille's port, in the area of J4, for three months. Ca. 35 000 people visited it, walking and sitting in the display. There was a tension in the installation between the specific materiality of the place enfolded in the objects brought by the city's local inhabitants, and that reminding locations such as Mauritius, where the project settled before, and was built the creole house around which revolves

the installation.

Reconsideration of the imaginary of the house

This tension between here and elsewhere produces a general dismantling of geographic orientation which seems to be crucially addressed through reconsideration of forms and imaginary of the house. *Mari Mira*'s material is that of the fragile remnants of everyday lives, plastic outdoor furniture, vases. All these elements interweave garden and house and develop a continuity, which can be read as linking exteriority and interiority. The dismantling of such boundaries finds a materialisation in the removal of doors and focus on what allows sight passages, as the windows, richly decorated. If house/home, as Marsha Meskimmon writes, comes as the site of reactionnary tendency to equate domesticity, as both home and nation ('domestic' as opposed to 'foreign'), with security" [Meskimmon 2014, p.6], by imagining conception for home as both a local phenomenon and inscribed in world movements, *Mari Mira* reorients domestic imaginary beyond the binary logic that structures the use of space. It comes to rethink the premise of identity, due to the importance of the myth equating home with identity.

New perspectives on identity

Consequently, the reappropriation of home, and close meaning of belonging, produces a debunking of the conditions on which heritage is commonly conceptualised, that is as a national expression, to suggest the establishment of a new founding logic, one capable of acknowledging the interactions between the local and the global, and the domestic and its 'others'. The new ways of thinking space through mobility, especially the dismantling of opposition between of exteriory/interiority, can be read as an impetus fostering a new sense of heritage, if, as Marsha Meskimmon writes, "borders are conceived to enclose cultural identity and sense of heritage" [Meskimmon 2014, p.6]. While the installation puts forth a conception of space based on new images of home and belonging, on movement, crossing of spaces and territories, the port as representation of France's dominancy over Mediterranean's area, is contested.

Heritage debates can also be addressed in considering how the project attempts to activate a function of remembrance of the historical uses of the site. When locating its project in the port, Guy-André Lagesse had in mind that "the place had seen for times the arrival of immigrant populations " [Interview with the artist, by the author, 2018]. As the artist invests the space with this consciounsess of its history, such preoccupation makes the notion of heritage relevant for his art, as Sabine Marschall defines heritage as the process of "conscious, purposeful" remembrance [Marschall 2016].

A decolonial approach ?

Interestingly, the sense of the port as an open place makes possible to provide those who recently arrived

in Marseille, and who, as a large part of adult population, were born out decolonizing French Empire in Africa suitable of representations of selves defined by mobilities. Production of displacement in this work is thus not only adressed in physical but in conceptual terms. Due to the fact that egopolitics hegemony occupies in modernity a central place, operations of displacement and relocation are precisely, explains Mignolo, able to play a critical role as conceptual gestures to accomplish a decolonizing politics of knowledge. This articulation may be what gives the work its decolonial dimension, since decoloniality can only be fulfilled by an act of displacement. However, how can decolonizing heritage be articulated with the broader realm of decolonizing knowledge? In the analysis of the extension of coloniality of power that Mignolo and Quijano offer [Mignolo 2007, p.450], knowledge, as gender, sexuality and subjectivity is subsumed under a larger category, that of being. Consequently, geography and body - by transforming classical subject's position – stand potentially for means to decolonize being. Architectonic process of decolonizing being makes, for Mignolo, decolonizing identity - whose heritage is a part - dependent on a critique of subjectivity. That is why Mignolo has stressed so much the necessity for groups of actors belonging "not necessarily to the right blood or skin color to a colonizing society to join project of decolonization" [Mignolo 2007, p.458].

While the question of colour seems unrelevant to us because it risks re-essentialising realities, when it pertains to the emergence of new epistemic positions, the location of subjects/artists, coming from Algeria, Morocco etc. assures a shift from egopolitics to geo-body politics of identity, which can be fruitful in thinking about decolonizing processes. While in the Arab World and Latin America, decolonizing the mind, which has emerged particularly strong, was connected to a redefinition of precolonial and colonial heritage and of the relationship to modernity and national identity, decolonizing processes in Europe - or in what Mignolo calls colonizers' societies- are dependent on how subjectivity and migration put forths a tension towards the classic subject.

3.2. Marseille 2013 : *Le Pont, Ici ailleurs* and the commissions of *Ateliers of Euroméditerranée*. Towards an institutionalization of the narrative of Marseille as an entangled city ?

General Framework

Le Pont was funded in part by Marseille Capital of Culture event, Marseille 2013. The ways Europe was thought in link to Mediterranean world contributed to :

- curate works provisioning resources that shaped re-emergence of colonial heritage in the city.

- commissions of works that are aesthetic resources pertaining to global/migrations issues.

- produce official discourse on Marseille as a post-colonial city, and Marseille's culture as a site entanglement.

Le Pont exhibition was held in MAC museum (25/05/2013-20/10/2013). Its title (in English *The Bridge*) evokes in the same time spatial and cultural connections and focus, as claimed by press release, on artists involved in processes of "multiple identities", which are produced by geographical migrations.

Underlying and stated aims

The exhibition aims at demonstrating how Marseille belongs to Mediterranean area, through an aesthetic argument: the role of migration in the production of artists' practices of Mediterranean shores is also a structuring feature. This cuts accross a biographical argument. A lot of the so-called global/post-colonial artists present in the exhibition have already lived, exhibited or worked in Marseille. It seeks at recognizing the migration as a component of contemporary art in Marseille and in Mediterreanean space.

The exhibition is defined by its singular positions in terms of epistemology, pertaining to issues of anthropology/history. Migration, as a paradigm of contemporary art, makes Mediterranean art relevant due to general criteria of international art scene. Thus, contemporary art shown at *Le Pont* is set within the realm of art genealogies and not anthropology. The exhibition posits itself in the debate of the self/same, in revolving around the notion of difference. For Thierry Ollat, the curator of the show, getting in touch with difference comes from displacement [Press release, 2013]. But at the scale of the works which invoke this displacement, migratory conditions in Mediterreanean space become a source for a common identity, a Mediterranean identity, as if difference and relativity were what was founding experience in this space.

Mention to post-colonialism is another singularity of the curator's discourse. Thierry Ollat addresses Mediterranean space as a hybrid space, between North and South, and which comes as a space to dehierarchize the epistemic tradition, that valorizes Occident, to rethink Europe from its margins[53]. How the curator points the "universal dimension of Mediterreanean experience" and its functioning on the model of "cultural diversity " is striking, as it fosters redefinitions of universalism's values, from the matrix of other spaces, leading to other contents (here, a re-assessment of difference as a cardinal value).

While Thierry Ollat reveals how bridging is about the spiritual journey running through connecting spaces, - as he argues "the bridge is an object that men have built in order to connect territories, a crossroads, that allows rising above the earth[54]", alternative meanings, lying in antique (pontos), and postcolonial realms, are thus reclaimed.

---

[53] Marseille, for Alain Donzel, is one space of this kind, at the periphery of Europe, at its frontiers. [Donzel 2001, p.29].
[54] TV Interview, La Chaîne Marseille, 2013. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=nCUASEMRX1Y

In the presentation text, the use of post-colonial vocabulary is stated with words such as "memory " and claims for "multiple identities ". However, the curator does not enter into the detail of what traditions or notions seem relevant to him. Thierry Ollat refers to antiquity in quoting Friedrich Nietzche's transcendental function of the bridge and the greek etymology of the French word for bridge, *pontos*. The kind of conflictuality that emerges from the merging of eurocentric and excentric traditions, and of pre-colonial and post-colonial temporalities may be considered as a specific handling of post-colonial debates. The curator's short text is not about the effects on artworks of the power relations born out colonisation. Thierry Ollat's approach might be, for this reason, submitted to the same kind of reproaches an author like Ella Shohat made to post-colonial theory, as reminded by Stuart Hall, "because it 'posits no clear domination and calls for no clear opposition'[55]".

Example : Zineb Sedira. The Port of the city as a connective motif between Marseille and former colonial cities

In *Le Pont,* numerous productions have staged a use of the port of Marseille as a resource to coin meanings that go beyond old power colonial relationships, and have invested its latent poetics of connectivities to offer new relationships between cities, mirroring today postcolonial and political needs. It appears that fostering new narratives on coloniality in Marseille goes along not by reversing or delinking the relationships between spaces formerly established by colonial rule but along exploiting the possibility of memorial reconfiguration arising from projects through which the port's past representation is re-rewritten as an archive of border crossing. As the port is hosting several narratives, going from colonial rule to such rewritings, working on such sites imposes the artists selecting which aspect of the past they want to involve or to contest. [Fig.34]

Zineb Sedira, belonging to a series of visual artists of Algerian origin, for whom, as Joseph McGonagle argues "a hyphenated identity that is positioning across national, cultural and social frontiers" [Welch and McGonagle 2011] is central to their work, was one of those whose who engaged the imaginary of the port. In 2013, Marseille capital of culture's funding allowed commissionning works of several artists including Zineb Sedira. She was invited to have a residency in the city, by programme Ateliers de l'Euroméditerranée, fostering links between economy and art, to produce a work around the site of the port. She seized this invitation as an opportunity to conclude her triptych video-project dedicated to the port of Algiers. Exhibited under the name *SweetJourneys* in two places, in La Galerie de la Jetée and on the port's area, the J1, the results explored various aspects of the international sugar trade and the cargo vessels that facilitated trade [Fig.35].

First, *Sugar routes* comprised large-scale photographs of a monumental sugar stack in the silo, located in the port, then the video-installation *Transmettre en abyme*, dealing with photographic collection Baudelaire, which was also

[55] http://readingtheperiphery.org/hall/

shown at exhibition about Mediterranean area *Ici, ailleurs*, in contemporary art center Friche de la Belle de Mai. In the latter, she filmed the handling and archival practices of Hélène Detaille, archivist of this collection which is one of the biggest collection about Marseille. The photographs were made by photograph Marcel Baudelaire after he opened his studio circa 1935, at the time when Marseille was a colonial capital – a period whose traces are palpable in the images he took of arrivals and departures from Marseille's port to, or from, main connections, such as Algiers and Tunis.

Zineb Sedira's film consists in showing, through repeated gestures around these photographs, the archivist's attachment to the collection of images of ships. Turning history into images is what gathers the two sections of the project. Photographs *Sugar Routes (1)* and *Sugar Routes (2)* included in the first part capture different states of the monumental stack of sugar and showed the progressive drying of the sweet substance that flows like sand. As explained by the artist, sugar has particular material and symbolic meaning, of slavery and globalisation. But it also conveys, by visual analogy, a memorial dimension, as sugar is sedimentated, a representation of history that Celeste Ianiciello has described as a "break with every neat, homogenous and linear representation of past and present " [Ianiciello 2018], operating through layers.

As reflected in Zineb Sedira's poetic image of sugar as time, present and past go hand in hand. Accessing the pier, which had been reintegrated to public access for the Marseille Capital of Culture event, fostered precisely experiencing such overlappings of territories as well as of histories. On the one hand, walking on the 7 km-long seawall favored a direct identification to the Baudelaire photographs which had been taken from this point view. On the other hand, walking there forstered poetic displacement to Algiers, whose seawall had itself served as model to the building of Marseille's one built in 1925, a production of spatial entanglements for which geographic echoes between Marseille and Algiers were also responsible. The sea, thus, acts in redefining the sense of Marseille's geographic definition, by unfolding its maritime space as a possibility to renew the representation of the city. Sedira' work is not so much about what makes a city local, specific, than global, and entangled.

There occurs thus, a shift facing the construction of Marseille's representation as part rather than to national to a transnational space and an aesthetic position, defined by the role of geographic indeterminacy. Depicting Marseille as part of Mediterranean sea becomes a means to productively engage with symetrical relationships of transnational exchanges which set the conditions under which getting to grip with the legacies of the colonial relationships envisioning the dominion on a city on the other. Considering Sedira's reclamation of another sense of space, her work makes relevant Joseph Mc Gonagle's claim for the necessity for cultural production analysis of Algerian/French to be updated in going beyond national frames, as emerge the "constant shuttling back and forth across the frontiers dividing France and Algeria" of artists and citizens inscribed in crossed stories. He argued instead for the necessity to think cultural production through France and Algeria together. What appears as an interpretative necessity to understand works located in-between thus stands for a opportunity to seize, on a methodological level, the occasion to break up with the narrative of differentiation which had been at the basis of colonialism. As he puts it : "it also means revisiting the extent to which France and Algeria can be separated out at all, and exploring the networks and flows which cut

across those frontiers almost to the point of disruption[56]".

Finally, that impredictability comes as one of the new senses engaged by artists to oppose the colonial handling of space, and its rationality is also something that qualifies these two projects, as they offer a multicerentered space, and a dual relationships between Marseille and Algiers. Resignifying the colonial into the globalised *Sugar routes* does not only think Algeria and France together, but Mediterreanean and Atlantic stories together. Such approach is thus a means to break with the binaries of the colonial logic. The ships she films remind the viewers of the Altantic history of the African diaspora to the Americas, a constant flux of forced migrations produced by the Brisith Empire that needed a work force in its Caribbean colonies. Conflating colonial and slavery histories puts forth multiple connections between the Atlantic Ocean and the Mediterranean sea, which acquire a subversive value: the narration of the colonial location is integrated in its displaced dynamic, undoing its Mediterranean and Occidental modernity.

[56] https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/09639489.2011.565159?src=recsys&journalCode=cmcf20

REFERENCES

Books

Nick Aikens (ed), *A Retrospective, Rasheed Araeen,* Dijon, Les Presses du réel, 2018.

Mathieu Kleyebe Abonnenc, Lotte Arndt and Catalina Lozano*, Ramper, dédoubler : collecte coloniale et affect*, Paris, B42, 2016.

Rasheed Araeen and al., *Contemporary Art and the Museum: A Global Perspective*, Ostfildern, Hatje Cantz, 2007.

Rasheed Araeen, "Art and Postcolonial Society" in Jonathan Harris (ed.), *Globalization and Contemporary Art*, Hoboken, Wiley-Blackwell, 2011, 365-375.

Robert Aldrich, *Vestiges of Colonial Empire in France,* Basingstoke, Palgrave Macmillan, 2014.

Hans Belting, Andrea Buddensieg and Peter Weibel, *The Global contemporary and the rise of new art worlds,* Karlsruhe, ZKM/Center for Art and Media Karlsruhe, 2013.

Brigitte Bertoncello and Jérôme Dubois, *Marseille, Euroméditerranée: accélérateur de métropole,* Marseille, Parenthèses, 2010.

Iain Chambers, Alessandra De Angelis, Celeste Ianniciello and Mariangela Orabona, *The Postcolonial Museum: The Arts of Memory and the Pressures of History,* Farnham, Ashgate Publishing, 2014.

Dominique Delgado and Yves Jeanmougin, *Belsunce: mémoires d'hier et d'aujourd'hui,* Marseille, Vidéo-Un, 1989.

Francesco Della& Casa, *La Friche la Belle de Mai projet culturel, projet urbain,* Marseille, Arles, Actes Sud, 2013.

André Donzel (ed.), *Métropolisation, gouvernance et citoyenneté dans la région urbaine marseillaise,* Paris, Maisonneuve Et Larose, 2001.

Anthony Downey*, Dissonant Archives: Contemporary Visual Culture and Contested Narratives in the Middle East,* London, I.B. Tauris, 2015.

Joan Gibbons, *Contemporary Art and Memory: Images of Recollection and Remembrance,* New York, I.B. Tauris, 2009.

Sylvia Girel, *La Réception des arts visuels contemporains dans les années 90 : les lieux de la diffusion de l'art à Marseille et leurs publics*, Sciences de l'homme et société, EHESS (PhD), 2000.

Sabine Glaubitz and Marc Wiltz, *Sur les murs de Marseille: street art in the city*, Paris, Magellan & Cie, 2014.

Benoît Guillaume and Nawel Louerrad, *Alger-Marseille: allers-retours*, Paris, Cambourakis, 2015.

Daniel Fabre et Anna Iuso (ed.), *Les Monuments sont habités,* Paris, Éditions de la Maison des sciences de l'homme, Ministère de la Culture, 2015.

Caroline Hancock, *Becoming Independent: Amina Menia and Zineb Sedira*, Dublin, Royal Hibernian Academy, 2013.

Alec Hargreaves and Mark McKinney (ed.), *Post-Colonial Cultures in France*, Londres, Routledge, 2013.

Alec Hargreaves, *Memory, Empire, and Postcolonialism: Legacies of French Colonialism*, Lanham, Lexington books, 2015.

Jonathan Harris, *Globalization and Contemporary Art*, Hoboken, Wiley-Blackwell, 2011.

Celeste Ianniciello, *Migrations, Arts and Postcoloniality in the Mediterranean*, London, Routledge, 2018.

William Kidd and Sian Reynolds (ed.), *Contemporary French Cultural Studies*, London, Routledge, 2000.

Fran Lloyd (ed.), *Contemporary Arab Women's Art: Dialogues of the Present,* London, WAL, 1999.

Brice Matthieussent, *Mari-Mira, Chronique d'un art plastique fait maison,* Paris, Éditions de l'œil, 2006.

Joseph McGonagle, *Representing Ethnicity in Contemporary French Visual Culture,* Manchester, Manchester University Press, 2017.

Marsha Meskimmon, *Foundation, Contemporary art and the cosmopolitan imagination,* London, Routledge, 2010.

Minayo Nasiali, *Native to the Republic: Empire, Social Citizenship, and Everyday Life in Marseille since 1945*, Ithaca, Cornell University Press, 2016.

Anne Ring Petersen, *Migration into art: Transcultural Identities and Art making in a Globalised World,* Manchester, Manchester Press, 2007.

Daniel Rycroft (ed.), *World Art and the Legacies of colonial violence,* London, Routledge, 2015.

Ella Shohat and Rober Stam, *Unthinking Eurocentrism, Multiculturalism and the Media,* London, Routledge, 1994.

Andrea L. Smith, *Colonial memory and postcolonial Europe : Maltese settlers in Algeria and France,* Bloomington, Indiana University Press, 2006.

Laurajane Smith, Paul A. Shackel, Gary Campbell and Michael Bailey*, Heritage, Labour, and the Working Classes,* London, Routledge, 2011.

Benjamin Stora and Émile Témime, *Immigrances: l'immigration en France au XXe siècle*, Paris, Hachette, 2007.

Émile Temime, Pierre Échinard, Renée Lopez, Marie-Françoise Attard-Maraninchi and Jean-Jacques Jordi, *Migrance: histoire des migrations à Marseille,* Aix-en-Provence, Edisud, 1991.

Émile Temime, *Migrance histoire des migrations à Marseille*, Marseille, J. Laffitte, 2007.

Marie-Paule Vial, *MAC: la collection, 1967-2007,* Paris, Paris Musées, 2007.

Monographic exhibition catalogues

Monique Deregibus*, Tour de l'Europe,* Valence le Haut, mars - juillet 1996, Valence, Ecole Régionale des Beaux-Arts,

1996.

Mari-Mira : Marseille, catalogue des inventions, Marseille, Les Pas perdus, juillet -août 1996.

Vincent Bonnet, *On ne vit qu'une fois, Marseille*, La Compagnie, 2006.

Monique Deregibus, *Hôtel Europa*, Trézélan, Filigranes, 2006.

Martine Derain, D'un seuil à l'autre, perspective sur une chambre avec ses habitants, Marseille, La Courte échelle, 2007.

Richard Dyer and Elvan Zabunyan, *Zineb Sedira, Saphir*, London, the Photographer's gallery, Paris, Kamel Mennour ; Paris, Paris musées, 29 September-26 November 2006.

Exhibition catalogues

L'Orient des Provençaux, Marseille, Musée des Beaux-arts, 1982-1983.

Mémoires de l'origine: Des photographes en Méditerranée, Marseille, Centre de la Vieille-Charité, 27 June-17 August 1987.

La Cie : 30 écrivains à Marseille, Marseille, La Compagnie, 1993.

Agnone, T., Alves, M. T., Barbier, G., Boursat, S., Deregibus, M., Fredet, E., Menanteau, O., ... Aux Armes ... Etcaetera, Münich, Künstlerwerkstatt Lothringer Straße, 1998.

Images d'Algérie, Marseille, Atelier de Visu, 2004.

Marseille Olympic Mix, Créteil, Maison des arts et de la culture André Malraux, 16 April -2 June 2007.

Marie-Paule Vial, *Marseille Artistes Associés: 1977-2007,* Marseille, Musées de Marseille *Musée Cantini,* Centre de la Vieille Charité, Musée d'Histoire, [Mac] Musée d'Art Contemporain, Ateliers d'Artistes du 27 octobre 2007 au 30 mars 2008, Paris, Éd. Archibooks.

Jean-Stéphane Borja, Martine Derain, Véronique Manry and Caroline Galmot, *Attention à la fermeture des portes ! Citoyens et habitants au coeur des transformations urbaines : l'expérience de la rue de la République à Marseille*, Éditions Commune, 2010.

New Cartographies: Algeria-France-UK, Manchester, Cornerhouse, 2011.

Euromed, Marseille, Château de Servières, 4 September - November 2012.

Marseille, Pavillon M, 30 May – July 2013.

Trésors exquis. Voyages et déplacements, Marseille, Pavillon M, 13 September - November 2013.

Ici ailleurs: exposition, Marseille, Friche Belle de mai-Tour Panorama, 12 January -31 March 2013, Paris, Skira-Flammarion.

Alger/Marseille, Allers et retours, Marseille, Mucem, 2014.

Collections partagées. Mathieu Kleyebe Abonnenc, Anne-Valérie Gasc, Sofi Urbani, Marseille, Frac Provence-Alpes-Côte d'Azur, 07 – 30 October 2016.

Zahia Rahmani and Jean-Yves Sarazin, *Made in Algeria: généalogie d'un territoire*, Marseille, Mucem, Paris, Hazan, 2016.

Peer review articles and journals

Oliver Barlet and Sylvie Chalaye, "Quel espace de création pour ces étrangers de l'intérieur ? " in *Ruptures postcoloniales*, Achille Mbembe and others (ed.), Paris, La Découverte, 2010.

Iain Chambers, " The Mediterranean. A postcolonial sea", *Third Text*, Volume 20, 2006.

Amanda Crawley Jackson, "(Re-)appropriations: Architecture and Modernity in the Work of Kader Attia", *Modern & Contemporary France*, 19:2, 2011, 163-177.

Denis Chevallier, "Collecter, Exposer Le Contemporain Au MUCEM", *Ethnologie Française* 38, no. 4, 2008, 631-37.

Lydie Delahaye, " Le Musée, à La Recherche Du Contemporain", *Vingtième Siècle. Revue d'histoire*, no. 123, 2014, 207-209.

Charles Fordsick and David Murphy, "Introduction : Situating Francophone Postcolonial thought" in Charles Fordsick and David Murphy (ed.), *Postcolonial Thought in the French Speaking World,* Liverpool, Liverpool University Press, 2009.

Stuart Hall, "When was the post-colonial" in Iain Chambers and Lidia Curti (ed.), *Post-Colonial Question: Common Skies, Divided Horizons*, London, Routledge, 1995.

Amy L. Hubbell, "Accumulating Algeria: Recurrent images in Pied-Noir visual works" in Natalie Edwards and Ben

McCann (eds.), *Framing French culture,* Adelaide, University of Adelaide, 2015.

Amy Hubbell, "Made in Algeria: Mapping layers of colonial memory into contemporary visual art", *French Cultural Studies*, 29, no. 2018, 8-18.

Philippe Joutard, "Marseille cosmopolite, Mythes et réalités", *Hommes et Migrations,* n°1099, 1986, 48-57.

Caroline Levander and Walter Mignolo, "Introduction: The Global South and World Dis/Order", The *Global South* 5, no. 1, 2011, 1-11.

" Le Maghreb", *Perspective : actualité en histoire de l'art*, n° 2/2017, special issue.

Mediterraneans – Méditerranéennes, "Marseille, derrière les façades", printemps 2002, n° 13.

Walter D. Mignolo, "Delinking", *Cultural Studies*, 21:2, 449 – 514, 2007.

Walter D. Mignolo, "Las Meninas: A Decolonial Response", *The* Art Bulletin, Volume 92, Issue 1-2, 2010.

Mireille Rosello, "De Massalia à La Planète Mars: Métissage Ou "fréquentage", *L'Esprit Créateur*, no. 3, 2001, 24-36.

Yaël Simpson Fletcher, "Capital of the Colonies : real and imagined boundaries between Metropole and Empire in the 1920s Marseilles", in Felix Driver and David Gilbert (ed.), *Imperial Cities: Landscape, Display and Identity,* Manchester, Manchester University Press, 1999.

Rachida Triki, "Le Régime postcolonial des arts et les usages de la modernité", *Rue Descartes*, 2007/4, n° 58, 104-111.

Alejandro A. Vallega, *"Displacements* – Beyond the Coloniality of Images", *Research in Phenomenology*, 2011, 206-227.

Edward Welch and Joseph McGonagle, "Untying the Knot? France and Algeria in Contemporary Visual Culture", *Modern and Contemporary France*, *19,* (2), 123-128, 2011.